Independent evaluation of the Subprogramme 5 (SP5): Africa, Least Developed Countries and Special Programmes (2013-17)

Punit Arora, PhD
Edouard Jay
Neema Manongi
John Mathiason

Geneva; Sep 4, 2018
Overall objective:

To promote development of national policies and international support measures to build productive capacities for economic development and poverty reduction in Africa, LDCs and other groups of countries in special situations and to progressively and beneficially integrate them into the global economy.

Implemented in accordance with the strategy detailed under Programme 10: Trade and Development of the UN’s Biennial Programme Plan for 2018-2019

Two Branches

- Trade and Poverty Branch
- Research and Policy Analysis Branch

32 staff members
Evaluation Methodology

Mixed method, triangulation (UNEG & OECD-DAC guidelines):

- Desk review: 321 documents +
- Headquarters consultations: Geneva, NY
- 3 Field missions (Ethiopia, Laos and Cambodia)
- Focus group discussions: 3 staff + 5 MS
- 139 semi-structured interviews
- Survey: 93 responses (= 49% response rate)
- External data, open source research

Watson, I know what caused the death

But you have only administered a few interviews and gone on two site visits. Should you not collect evidence that is more robust?
UNCTAD staff: 36%

Member-State representatives: 21%

Workshop participants/trainees: 20%

Collaborators: 9%

Products users: 9%

Donor's representatives: 2%

Other UN staff: 3%
Design and relevance
* **Doha and Nairobi Mandates**
  * Paragraph 10(a) to 10(e) of the Nairobi Maafikiano
* **Custodian of SDG 12.6, Contributes to 4 SDGs: 17, 10, 9 and 8**
* **Partner for the World Bank on SDG 17.4**
* **WTO and ITC on SDG 17.10, 17.11 and 17.12.**
* **Contributes to 52 specific targets on 10 of the 17 SDGs.**
Respondents’ needs assessment

- Capacity development: 50%
- Policy support: 15%
- Institutional reforms: 12%
- Partnerships: 7%
- Research: 6%
- Norms integration: 1%
- Awareness creation: 1%
- Regional integration: 1%
- Others: 7%

*Source: UNCTAD*
Effectiveness
Research & publications
Policy briefs
Consensus-building
Norms and agenda-setting
Technical cooperation
Overview

❖ Research, TC and consensus-building

❖ All interventions rated highly

❖ BUT ….
Self-cited use of publications

- Policy development
  - Staff: 12
  - External: 17
- Academic or non-academic research
  - Staff: 10
  - External: 15
- Training others
  - Staff: 7
  - External: 14
- Planning activities
  - Staff: 2
  - External: 12
- Awareness creation
  - Staff: 4
  - External: 10
- Influencing policies
  - Staff: 3
  - External: 8
- Advocacy in media
  - Staff: 3
  - External: 2
- Others
  - Staff: 4
  - External: 5
Effectiveness

* Downloads: 267K (EDAR), 92K (LDCR)

* Stories in media (Lexis Nexis): EDAR (283), LDCR (262)

* Google Scholar Citations: EDAR (120), LDCR (84)
Perceived usefulness of SP5 products

ALDC Products: Opinions on Usefulness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ALDC Products: Opinions on Usefulness</th>
<th>Training</th>
<th>Technical assistance</th>
<th>Guidelines &amp; manuals</th>
<th>Policy briefs</th>
<th>Publications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not Aware</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aware but not used</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used but not found useful</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used and found useful</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Used and found very useful</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Perceived usefulness of research products

EDAR
LDCR
DTIS
RPS
Others

- Not Aware
- Aware but not used
- Used but not found useful
- Used and found useful
- Used and found very useful
Satisfaction with various attributes of the publications

- Independence
- Credibility
- Analytical depth
- Topical coverage
- Relevance to your work
- Geographical coverage

Staff: 0.92, 1.05, 0.98, 0.83, 0.76, 0.89
External: 1.11, 1.06, 1.11, 0.91, 0.91, 1.00
All: 0.98, 1.05, 0.98, 0.91, 0.95, 1.00
Technical cooperation

* Highly valued and sought after

* DTIS and EIF
Policy changes: Examples

❖ Tourism in Mali & Somalia
❖ Trade facilitation in Djibouti
❖ eCommerce readiness in Liberia, Burkina Faso, Senegal, etc.
❖ LDC graduation in Tuvalu, Vanuatu, and Nepal
❖ Ethiopia: DTIS to mainstream trade into its national plan
❖ Geographical indications and cassava projects in Cambodia
❖ Value chain development strategy in Cambodia
❖ Entrepreneurship development policies in Gambia
Consensus-building

- EDAR and LDCR reflected in TDB agreements.
  - 4 of 5 recommendations from the 2015 EDAR on trade in services.
  - 4 of 7 from the 2017 EDAR on tourism.
  - 2015 LDCR on rural economies

- Cited in SG’s reports to the General Assembly, especially in 2014.

- UN DESA reported using NVPs produced by SP5 in considering the issue of graduation of LDCs.
Challenges

❖ Partnership and collaboration
❖ Avoidable duplication
❖ Small projects
❖ New programmatic/ regional approach ✔️
Efficiency
Efficiency: Outputs/inputs

- Human resources: The major expense
- Small division, big responsibilities
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grants out</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment, Vehicles and Furniture</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating and Other Costs</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractual services</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project support costs</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training (incl. Participant travel)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travel (Staff)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff (incl. consultants)</td>
<td>6458</td>
<td>6010</td>
<td>5328</td>
<td>5794</td>
<td>5426</td>
<td>4693</td>
<td>5314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6603</td>
<td>6160</td>
<td>5631</td>
<td>6280</td>
<td>6266</td>
<td>5579</td>
<td>5931</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Share of Division on Africa, Least Developed Countries and Special Programmes in extrabudgetary technical cooperation expenditures, 2013–2017

Total budget: USD 94,790,340
Contributions and contributors

Total Contributions (2011-17) = US$5.02M
**Implementation rates as per Programme of Work**

**Source:** IMDIS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Excluding TC</th>
<th></th>
<th>Including TC</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total outputs</td>
<td>Implementation rate (%)</td>
<td>Total outputs</td>
<td>Implementation rate (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALDC</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DGDS</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>454</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIAE</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>531</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DITC</td>
<td>297</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTL</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>347</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>1 650</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>2 424</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Efficiency: Outputs/inputs

* Managing resources efficiently
  * opportunities for adjustment and prioritization
Impacts & sustainability
Impact

OECD/ DAC results-chain

Output (Immediate Result)

Outcome (Intermediate Achievement)

Impact (Achieved Objectives)
Significant impacts:
Contributions during 2013-17

* AfCFTA
* Ethiopia- Djibouti corridor
* Fisheries in Uganda and Mozambique; Centres of Excellence in Mauritius and Vietnam
* Angola, Bhutan and Laos integrated UNCTAD policy recommendations into their respective graduation strategies
* Geographic Indications project in Laos and capacity development project in Ethiopia reportedly helped farmers improve their performance in exports markets for palm sugar and coffee respectively
Sustainability

❖ Follow-up and inadequate TA: A major issue

❖ Economic Development in Africa Report:
  ❖ Private sector dynamism (2013),
  ❖ Investment for transformative growth (2014),
  ❖ Services trade (2015),
  ❖ Debt dynamics and development finance (2016),
  ❖ Tourism (2017)
  ❖ Migration (2018).

❖ The Least Developed Countries Report:
  ❖ Growth with employment (2013),
  ❖ Post-2015 development agenda (2014),
  ❖ Transforming rural economies (2015),
  ❖ Path to graduation (2016).
Partnerships & Cooperation
Partnerships & Cooperation

* Steps to promote collaboration:
  * Interdivisional publications committee at UNCTAD,
  * Proposed joint publication of Economic Development Report with UNECA,
  * Train for Trade project in Angola, and most notably,
  * The UN Inter-Agency Cluster on Trade and Productive Capacity

* Better at forging partnerships with direct beneficiaries

* “Disadvantaged by not having ears to the ground”
Gender & human rights
Human rights & Gender equality

- Numerous UN commitments
- Reports increasingly highlight gender issues
- Much more needs to be done

**Table 3. Gender representation in staff**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ALDC</th>
<th>UNCTAD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Staff:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>60% 40% 25</td>
<td>66% 34% 335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
<td>14% 86% 7</td>
<td>24% 76% 149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultants</td>
<td>80% 20% 45</td>
<td>59% 41% 422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>52 25 77</td>
<td>531 375 906</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusions
SWOT analysis

- Quality of outputs
- Impactful work
- Inadequate resources
- Follow up
- M&E
- Field presence
- Portfolio rebalancing
- Regional presence
- UN reforms
- Partnerships
- Unmet needs
- Sustainability
Ratings on various dimensions

- Relevance of publications to trade & development: 65
- Relevance of technical assistance to trade & development: 53
- Effectiveness of publications to understanding trade & development: 57
- Effectiveness of technical assistance to solving trade & development: 59
- Efficiency of interventions and resource use by ALDC/SP5: 46
- Effectiveness of response to the gender and human rights issues: 47
- Effectiveness on use of partnerships & networks: 49

Staff • External • All
Recommendations
1a

• Rebalancing the portfolio
• Interdivisional resource allocations
Sustainability considerations

This is how your baby gets the best protection

Some Protection
1st Dose
2 months

More Protection
2nd Dose
4 Months

Better Protection
3rd Dose
6 Months

Long Lasting Protection
4th Dose
18 Months

This is how the pertussis (whooping cough) vaccine works. The number of doses and when they are given depends on the vaccine.
• Fundraising strategy
• Partnerships roadmap

"You make a good point; we both hate the cat. I'm just not sure what it is you'd bring to a partnership."
• Integration of regional office
• Measuring results more systematically
• HRGE considerations
OVERALL CONCLUSION

Substantial contribution towards improving the effectiveness of stakeholder response to current and emerging challenges
Thank you!
### Table 2. Outputs and manpower (2017): A comparison across divisions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ALDC</th>
<th>DGDS</th>
<th>DIAE</th>
<th>DITC</th>
<th>DTL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substantive servicing of meetings</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parliamentary documentation</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert groups, rapporteurs, depository services</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recurrent publications</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-recurrent publications</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other substantive activities</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory services</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training courses, seminars and workshops</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field projects</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference services, administration, oversight</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total outputs</strong></td>
<td>140</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>433</td>
<td>454</td>
<td>482</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*P: Programmed, A: Actual

**Self-reported work months (SWM) per IMDIS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ALDC</th>
<th>DGDS</th>
<th>DIAE</th>
<th>DITC</th>
<th>DTL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>405</td>
<td>1181</td>
<td>1321</td>
<td>735</td>
<td>939</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Staff (Source: HRMS UNCTAD):**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ALDC</th>
<th>DGDS</th>
<th>DIAE</th>
<th>DITC</th>
<th>DTL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P+</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GS</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Permanent staff</strong></td>
<td>32</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultants</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total staff</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adjusted total staff (ATS)</strong></td>
<td>43.25</td>
<td>86.25</td>
<td>107.5</td>
<td>110.5</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SWM/ATS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ALDC</th>
<th>DGDS</th>
<th>DIAE</th>
<th>DITC</th>
<th>DTL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Lower bound (-10%)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ALDC</th>
<th>DGDS</th>
<th>DIAE</th>
<th>DITC</th>
<th>DTL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Upper bound (10%)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ALDC</th>
<th>DGDS</th>
<th>DIAE</th>
<th>DITC</th>
<th>DTL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** ATS assumes consultants work 3 months/year on an average.