UN Trade Forum: SDGs and Climate Change
Third Oceans Forum: Taking stock of final phase of fish subsidies negotiations

Positive and harmful subsidies: a fishing industry perspective on WTO negotiations on fish subsidies

Daniel Voces de Onaíndi
Managing Director
Europêche
Geneva, 10 September 2019
EU fishing industry importance

As food producers, the fishing sector has a clear added value and plays a major role for **food security**, differentiating us from other economic activities in the EU's integrated maritime policy and the blue growth strategy.

Public funding should support and take care of our fish and fishermen alike.

- **83,117 vessels**
- **5 million tonnes/yr**
- **14 billion meals/yr**
- **value of €7 billion**
- **152,000 fishers jobs**
Fisheries Subsidies: is the aid justified?

Europêche fully supports SDG 14 to eliminate harmful fishery subsidies.

- Discipline fishery subsidies at multilateral level (WTO)
  - ✔Already done in Europe

Fishery subsidies should continue with a clear objective of environmental, economic and social sustainability.

- The fishing industry cannot be deprived from aids to research, innovation and modernisation of the vessels
- Need to enhance the competitiveness and viability of fishery enterprises, safety and working conditions to guarantee a long-term sustainable fleet, which supply healthy seafood to a growing world-population
- Support the implementation of costly standards set by the EU Fisheries Policy: MSY, landing obligation, selectivity, environmental rules...

The European Maritime and Fisheries Fund 2014-2020

€6,400 M
Allocated in total from 2014-2020.

- Sustainable Fisheries
  - Making fisheries and aquaculture more sustainable and profitable
  - Ensuring and creating sustainable jobs
  - Local development and support to fisheries areas
  - Marketing and processing

- Control and Enforcement
  - To help fishermen adapt to sustainable fishing, create jobs for the sector and diversify economies in coastal communities.
  - To monitor compliance with the European Common Fisheries Policy and protect a fair access to healthy stocks:
    - Access to fishing grounds
    - Controlling fishing effort, TACs and quotas
    - Other technical measures to improve selectivity and sustainability

- Data Collection
  - To collect the data the scientists need to improve our knowledge of the seas and the long term management of our fisheries:
    - Understanding and monitoring of commercial species
    - Dynamics of single stocks and mixed fisheries
    - Ecological modelling of regional basins

- Blue Economy
  - To unlock sustainable growth and job creation from our seas and oceans, in areas such as:
    - Maritime surveillance (CISE)
    - Improved knowledge of the seas and ecosystems
    - Enabling rational exploitation of new marine resources (e.g. energy, biotech)
Fisheries Subsidies: scope

- **Positive list of aids** that should be excluded from the scope:
  - Subsidies for safety, health, hygiene, working conditions, marketing, research, innovation, selectivity and sustainability of stocks
  - Resilience and reduction of climate change impact (energy efficiency)
  - Control and enforcement equipment
  - Disaster relief
  - Fishery access agreements to 3rd country EEZs
  - **Careful with aquaculture exclusion!** May create possible loopholes concerning subsidies for forage fish, like small pelagics, taken out of the ocean to supply industrial aquaculture
  - Fuel de-taxation schemes
Fisheries Subsidies: scope

Are fuel de-taxation schemes subsidies?

**Tax breaks**

- Less governmental revenue
- Different tax levels depending on the use (heating, industrial, user)
- Reward the added value generated by the contributor

**Subsidies**

- Money taken from Peter and given to Paul
- Direct payments to the beneficiary
- Grant unearned goods to beneficiaries favoured by the State

Are fuel de-taxation schemes subsidies?
Fisheries Subsidies: scope

- **Against** any direct aid for fuel purchase
  - Link subsidy levels to fuel prices
  - Distorts international fish markets → unfair competition between operators

- **In favour** of fuel de-taxation schemes
  - Energy products supplied for use as fuel for the purposes of navigation and aviation historically exempted from taxation
  - De-taxation schemes in the EU apply to the entire sea navigation inside 12nm, including fishing → **No fiscal sovereignty outside the 12nm**
  - International **Level playing field**
Fisheries Subsidies: scope

- **Fuel taxation consequences:**
  - Would lead to *unfair treatment* between territories - large ships can undertake long fishing trips on single fuel bunkering enabling them to refuel at ports with lower fuel prices.
  - Could lead to an *increase in the prices* paid by final consumers, particularly for fresh products.
  - *Reduce the profitability of all fishing companies,* with special emphasis to artisanal fishermen operating within the 12nm zone.
  - Fuel costs for fishing vessels may exceed 40% of the total operating costs.
Aviation
• Major source of emissions, increasing 21% within Europe in the last three years, and is projected to continue to grow
• Proposal: intra EU carbon tax for fuel

Shipping
• International maritime sector accounted for 2.6% of global CO2 emissions in 2014 and its emissions would expand steadily in the absence of a mitigation policy
• Proposal: carbon tax as a key element of GHG mitigation policy for international maritime transport

Fishing
• Alleged global collapse of fish stocks
• Elimination of subsidies contributing to overcapacity and overfishing
• Proposal: elimination of fuel de-taxation schemes

Fisheries Subsidies: scope
Are fish stocks collapsing?
Why a different approach?
Global State of Fish Stocks

90% of global fish stocks are fully fished or overfished. We must end harmful fisheries subsidies.
Global State of Fish Stocks

33% harvested at unsustainable levels
60% maximally sustainably fished
7% under-fished

• Industry acknowledges that further efforts are needed

• Lumping overfished (33% of stocks) with maximally/sustainably fished (60%) gives oxygen to the exaggeration of the issue:
  ➢ NO MAN-MADE TRAGEDY

• The majority of the global fisheries (67%) are currently sustainable!

• “Maximally sustainably fished” is what countries have agreed to aim for: MSY. Fishing sector only targets a small fraction of fish stocks to secure the long term sustainable use

• No marine fish has ever gone extinct due to fishing
Great achievements at record-breaking speed in the EU

Equally important the number of tonnes sustainably fished

NE Atlantic biomass levels 36% higher than in 2003

59 stocks fished at MSY levels, compared to only 5 in 2009

Almost 100% of landings from EU managed stocks in the Atlantic come from catches sustainably fished

82% of the fish consumed worldwide is sustainable, 86% in the case of tuna
Efforts made by EU fishing industry

- EU capacity fleet declined in both tonnage and engine power

- Despite the enlargements of the EU, the number of EU vessels in 2018 was 81,644 compared to 103,834 in 1996 = 22,000 fishing vessels less in 20 years

- Only 65,400 remain active

- Wild-caught fish is, by far, the animal protein with the lowest carbon food print

- Seafood is the best option in terms of food security to fight climate change
Efforts made by EU fishing industry

Despite de-taxation fuel schemes in Europe:
- fishing effort ↓
- energy consumption ↓

**Conclusion:** in Europe de-taxation fuel schemes have not led to overfishing nor overcapacity
Fisheries Subsidies: Geographical scope

- **Extension of the prohibitions** to the entire ocean without excluding specific geographic areas (e.g. territorial sea)

- **Geographical limitations** could present obstacles for the conservation and sustainable use of straddling and migratory fish stocks

- **Difficult to track** a subsidy to a particular fishing area, as the beneficiary vessel or company can fish in different areas and seasons

→ In order to achieve an **international level playing field**, any regional, national or local public aid must follow and respect the WTO disciplines on fisheries subsidies!
Fisheries Subsidies: IUU

- No Member shall grant or maintain any subsidy to vessels and operators engaged in **IUU fishing**
  
  - EU funding already conditional upon compliance with strong IUU policy. No serious infringements:
    - 1 year prior to the date application
    - 5 years after the final payment to the beneficiary
    - Temporary or permanent ban on access to public assistance or subsidies if found guilty
  
  - Determined or listed in an IUU fishing list
    - Not just identified (presumption of innocence)
  
  - By the Flag, Subsidizing or RFMO authorities
    - Coastal state decision to be considered by the subsidizing state
Fisheries Subsidies: Overfished 1/3

- No Member shall grant or maintain any subsidy for fishing that negatively affects **targeted** fish stocks that are in an **overfished condition**:
  - Determined by the Flag, Subsidizing or RFMO authorities
  - Management measures into consideration
  - Include territorial seas
    - Concern few stocks
    - Commercial fishing takes place inside this area
Definition of ‘overfished stocks’

1. “When is at such a low level that mortality from fishing needs to be restricted to allow the stock to rebuild to a level that produces MSY or alternative reference points based on the best scientific evidence available”

2. Recognised by the competent authority

3. No effective management plan in place
Under no circumstances a **data poor or unassessed stock** can be presumed to be overfished

- Abuse of the precautionary approach principle
- Fisheries lacking formal assessment comprise >80% of global catch
- Often the case in mixed fisheries - MSY assessments limited by data availability, government resources and scientific capabilities
- Large unassessed fisheries may be performing nearly as well as their assessed counterparts
- There must be evidence that the unassessed stock is overfished
Fisheries Subsidies: Overcapacity 1/2

- No Member shall grant or maintain any subsidy that:
  - Supports the acquisition and **renewal of fishing vessels**, except for small-scale (12 metres) provided that:
    - The segment of the corresponding fleet is in balance with the available fishing opportunities
    - The national ceiling of fishing capacity assigned to each Member is respected
    - An obsolete fishing vessel is replaced (≤ capacity on the basis of an entry/exit scheme)
  - Supports the **transfer, importation or reflagging** of fishing vessels to third countries including the creation of joint ventures with partners of those countries
Fisheries Subsidies: Overcapacity 2/2

- No Member shall grant or maintain any subsidy that:
  - **Increases the fishing capacity** of a fishing vessel:
    - But exemption of “safety/social tonnage”
      (crew accommodation, recreational areas, toilets, kitchen, …)
  - Supports the **acquisition of equipment** that increases the catching capacity of a fishing vessel (e.g. fishing gears)
Thank you for your attention!

www.europeche.org

twitter.com/EuropecheOrg

@europeche.org

europeche@europeche.org