A strategy for Robust Growth and debt reduction in the Caribbean: The ECLAC perspective

Dillon Alleyne PhD
Deputy Director, ECLAC Subregional Headquarters for the Caribbean, Port of Spain

The Intergovernmental Group of Experts on Financing for Development
Room 26, Palais des Nations, Geneva.

Thursday 8 November 2018.

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
Structure of the Presentation

1. Debt profile Caribbean Vs Other SIDS
2. Underlying causes of the debt burden
3. Current challenges to reducing the debt
4. Structural transformation and resilience building – The case for investment in Green Industries
5. A regional response to the Caribbean’s debt challenge
6. Conclusion
Debt profiles: Caribbean vs SIDS

CARIBBEAN TOTAL PUBLIC DEBT, 2008-2017
(Per cent of GDP)

SIDS TOTAL PUBLIC DEBT AVERAGE, 2008-2017
(Per cent of GDP)

Source: Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps

ECLAC Caribbean total debt owed was US$56b, the total external was US$25b and the total domestic was 31b in 2017.

In 2017 the debt burden was:
- 73.4% GDP for the Caribbean. 75.9% for service producers. 66.4% for goods producers.
- The Caribbean’s external debt was 0.1% of world external debt, which is 55.7% of SIDS debt. A solution poses no systemic global financial risks.
- The four largest debtors excluding T and T account for US32b.
- Bilateral/multilateral debt large for some countries.
Debt structure

Debt service and debt structure

CARIBBEAN DEBT SERVICE BURDEN, 2017

COMPOSITION OF TOTAL PUBLIC DEBT, 2017
(Per cent of GDP)

External Debt Service Payments
(percent of exports of goods and services)

Source: ECLAC based on official data
Note: Data for Barbados is for 2015 and The Bahamas is for 2016.

Debt service and debt structure

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
EXTERNAL DEBT SERVICE PAYMENTS
(Per cent of exports of goods and services)

Source: ECLAC based on official data
Note: Goods Producers are Belize, Guyana, Suriname and Trinidad and Tobago. Service Producers are Anguilla, Antigua and Barbuda, the Bahamas, Barbados, Dominica, Grenada, Jamaica, Montserrat, Saint Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia and Saint Vincent and the Grenadines.
No data are available for Barbados for 2016 and 2017, and for the Bahamas for 2017.

Sources: IDB calculations; and International Monetary Fund, World Economic Outlook (April 2017).

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
Structural weaknesses which lead to falling import productivity /falling labour productivity/loss of tourism competitiveness

These give rise to export challenges at the internal and external margin.

Low technological intensity of exports-firms operating outside of global value chains.

Pro-cyclical approach to fiscal policy and already high tax burden relative to Latin America.

Underlying causes (Beyond fiscal excesses)
Underlying causes (Beyond fiscal excesses)

- Low growth since the global crisis. High debt service costs despite a low interest rate regime. Difficult for government to deploy complementary expenditure to incentivise the private sector. Negative relationship between debt and growth.

- Investment to GDP fairly high relative to SIDS but efficiency of investment low.

- High vulnerability to external shocks—commodity prices and tourism volatility.

- Region vulnerable to Extreme weather events and climate change. Since 1990 328 natural disasters and US$30 billion in damage and losses (ECLAC).

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
Low growth: Caribbean Vs Rest of SIDS

CARIBBEAN GDP RELATIVE TO REST OF SIDS, 2000-2017
(Percentage)

CARIBBEAN AND REST OF SIDS GDP GROWTH
(Percentage)

Source: World Bank World Development Indicators Database

Source: ECLAC and World Bank World Development Indicators
Growth volatility due to Export concentration and the low technology intensity of exports

**COMPOSITION OF CARIBBEAN SERVICE EXPORTS, 2007-2016**

*Percentage*

- Transportation
- Personal, cultural, and recreational services
- Government services, n.i.e.
- Travel
- Communications services
- Insurance services
- Financial services
- Computer and information services
- Royalties and license fees
- Other business services

Source: UN Service Trade Database, 2016

**TECHNOLOGY INTENSITY OF CARIBBEAN EXPORTS**

*Percentage of total exports*

- Primary Products
- Natural resource based manufactures
- Medium Technology manufactures
- Low Technology manufactures

Source: UN Comtrade via WITS

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
Productivity of Investment is Low

GROSS FIXED CAPITAL FORMATION, 2004-2015
(Per cent of GDP)

FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT, NET INFOWS, 2004-2016
(Per cent of GDP)

Source: World Bank World Development Indicators Database

Caribbean
Rest of SIDS

Caribbean (13)
Rest of SIDS (22)
Underlying causes

INDEBTEDNESS AND ENVIRONMENTAL VULNERABILITY OF COMMONWEALTH SMALL STATES

Barbados
Jamaica
Belize
Dominica
Antigua and Barbuda
Saint Vincent and the Grenadines
Grenada
Saint Lucia
Maldives
Seychelles
Saint Kitts and Nevis
Mauritius
Bahamas
Vanuatu
Lesotho
Papua New Guinea
Swaziland
Botswana
Solomon Islands

Source: IMF World Economic Outlook, April 2018 database and South Pacific Applied Geoscience Commission Environmental Vulnerability Index 2004

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
### A key driver of Caribbean debt

#### 2017 Hurricane season:
(2017 US dollars million)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Damage</th>
<th>Loses</th>
<th>Additional costs</th>
<th>Total cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anguilla</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sint Maarten</td>
<td>1,049</td>
<td>988</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>2,089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Virgin Is.</td>
<td>1,650</td>
<td>444</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>2,292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turks &amp; Caicos Is.</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Bahamas</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antigua and Barbuda</td>
<td>136.1</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>222.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominica</td>
<td>931</td>
<td>382</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,276.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,272.9</strong></td>
<td><strong>318</strong></td>
<td><strong>6,990.2</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ECLAC’s assessment teams and World Bank PDNAs
Challenges to reducing the debt

- Middle income status of Caribbean SIDS. Reduced access to concessional finance.
- Largest contributors to the changing debt burden: interest rate effects (despite a low interest rate regime), low growth and unanticipated shocks (including contingent liabilities).
- With projected low growth, possibility of US rates rising and existing borrowing requirements, debt service will remain high.
- Intense fiscal adjustments necessary to reduce the debt are growth reducing. Aggravated by the historically high primary surpluses.

Note: Debt sustainability analysis by Commonwealth/WB/IMF suggest unsustainability. The first two have proposals for debt reduction/limited approach.

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
A sustainable development strategy must enhance growth while reducing debt.

World trade in green goods, technologies and services in 2014 totalled some US$1.4 trillion (CIGI, 2014).

Green industries can contribute to sustainable development- Opportunities in energy, education, health, labour export, etc. Jamaica’s 2030 agenda.

Green sectors can expand employment creation through the provision of global services. EG BPO sector mindful of automation focused on high level returns.

Caribbean countries have prioritised self-sufficiency in renewable energy.

Pathway to resilient development which is the SDGs.
A regional response to the Caribbean’s debt challenge

The ECLAC Proposal

Channeling pledged climate funds to write down Caribbean debt

Creation of the Caribbean Resilience Fund (CRF)

Need for interaction between multilateral institutions, donor countries, and small states debtor counties without proper debt workout mechanism.

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
A regional response to the Caribbean’s debt challenge

How it works: for multilateral and bilateral debt

- GCF funds and others will be used to finance a gradual write down of 100% of the Caribbean SIDS’ multilateral and bilateral debt stock
- Debtors agree to make annual payments into the CRF in an amount equal or less than the discounted debt service payments
- CRF will also be capitalized by contributions from bilateral donors and funds raised through PPPs

ECLAC proposal on debt for climate adaptation swaps
A regional response to the Caribbean’s debt challenge

How it works: for debt to private creditors

- GCF and other funds used to buyback debt to private creditors, but at a deep discount
- New loan agreements will have lower interest rates and longer maturities, leading to savings that can be invested in climate projects and green industries
- Debt for equity swaps can be employed in cases where much of the debt is held by domestic commercial banks
Continuation of structural reforms including support for PERs. This orients public spending with government priorities/ intensify PPPs.

Improve and expand the space for new Business activities/ raise the share of new sectors in total economic activity.

Search for new markets including improving airlift to LA/China- open the space for full engagement of the diaspora.

Improve logistics and regional interconnection (especially through ICT) to advance sub-regional & regional value chains. Firms must be global in outlook. Fewer Caribbean firms export relative to SIDS

Improve local technological capacity/best sought at the regional level

Invest carefully in expanding and upgrading labour skills/focus on learning by doing/learning by experimentation/learning to learn and the enhancement of tacit learning.

Public policy must focus on longer term planning horizons.
Conclusions

In moving forward...

A number of member states have endorsed the proposal

Governments, creditors and climate donors would need to come together to negotiate the details of the arrangement

ECLAC stands ready to engage key stakeholders and partners in order to advance this initiative.
Thank You