1ST TECHNICAL WORKING GROUP MEETING

ASSESSMENT OF ORGANIC CERTIFICATION IN THE VIRGIN COCONUT OIL VALUE CHAIN IN THE PHILIPPINES

25 November 2019 Makati Diamond Hotel, Metro Manila





<u>Republic of the Philippines</u> Department of Agriculture Philippine Coconut Authority



UNCTAD Assessment - Supporting materials:

- Executive Summary
- Brochure
- Presentation



Assessment of organic certification in the coconut oil value chain in the Philippines

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

UNCTAD Project (DA-1617AI): Fostering the development of green exports through Voluntary Sustainability Standards Contact: Miho Shirotori (miho.shirotori@unctad.org)

January 2019



OVERVIEW: Voluntary Sustainability Standards (VSS) are gaining importance in many developed and developing countries to address sustainability issues. They are slowly being mainstreamed in domestic and international market to satisfy the sustainable behaviour and modern lifestyle of consumers. Certification is one of many VSS tools used by producers to adhere to sustainability standards and for consumers to make objective buying decisions. Organic certification is the most widely applied VSS in the agriculture sector, where about 2.7 million producers in 178 countries applied organic agriculture in 2016. As modern society increasingly demands traceability of organic products from field to table, many organic certifications require sustainable production along the entire value chain.

OBJECTIVES: This study aimed to identify how actors in the Philippine coconut oil value chain can effectively respond to the growing pressures from consumers, private sector, and stakeholders regarding the adoption of sustainable practices, which contribute to improving market opportunities and the country's green exports. The coconut sector remains important for economic and rural development in the Philippines; i.e. where coconut areas in 1,195 municipalities and 79 provinces account for 30% of total farmlands and employ 3.5 million coconut farmers who comprise 20% of the country's poor. Coconut oil is the top agricultural export commodity, contributing 23% to the total value of Philippine agricultural exports in 2015. The major export markets are the United States, Europe, and other developed countries with very high demand for sustainability standards.

METHODS: The methods used in the study include value network mapping, cross tabulation, and policy analysis of survey data, which were collected through chain referral sampling of actors in the coconut oil value chain including coconut workers, tenants, farmers, and middlemen as well as coconut oil processors and exporters. Key institutions also participated in the survey, including decision-makers, administrators, and practitioners from academic, government and non-government institutions, certification bodies, and producers' associations. The results of the analyses are challenges and policy options in organic certification, which will be used as inputs to the development of National Action Plan (NAP) and establishment of a Multi-Stakeholder Platform for VSS in the Philippines.



INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT: The Organic Agriculture Act 2010 mandates the DA-BAFS¹ to accredit organic certifying Bodies (OCBs), which are responsible for verifying compliance of certified actors to prescribed organic standards. The Philippine National Standard for Organic Agriculture (PNS-OA) was revised in 2016 to harmonize national standards with the ASEAN standards² and procedure with

¹ Bureau of Agriculture and Fisheries Standards in the Department of Agriculture (DA-BAFS)

² ASEAN Standard for Organic Agriculture (ASOA)

the national accreditation body DTI-PAB³ and international standards (ISO). The OCCP⁴ is currently the only national OCBs operating in the country, while Control Union and ECOCERT are examples of international OCBs mainly serving organic exports. The government provides subsidies for organic certification through the DA-BAFS and different agencies provide support like technical advice and capacity building to coconut associations.

FATHWAYS TO CERTIFICATION: The three main pathways to organic certification in the Philippines are direct applications to OCBs, membership in associations, and awareness through government programs. The OCBs disseminate information on certification and provide seminars to coconut producers of the certified processors. Associations provide information on and support application to organic certification through close partnership with the relevant government agencies (e.g. DA-BAFS, DTI, PCA⁵) and OCBs. The government's development programs provide direct support that encourages certification of production, processing, and export of coconut oil in the Philippines. The government has also established partnership with various institutions (e.g. academic, NGOs, OCBs, etc.) to promote sustainable agriculture.

NETWORKS OF VALUE CHAIN: There are complex links between the actors in the coconut oil value chain, which may begin from the input (i.e. labour) providers to the farmers and end at either exporters or processors, if the latter are exporting coconut oil in foreign markets. The networks are not completely exclusive because some actors like middlemen and processors can be involved in more than one network. Associations play an important role in the networks, providing access to information, support on organic certification, and links to value chain actors. Many of the coconut producers in the value chain are old with low level of education, while the middlemen, processors, and exporters are mostly younger and well educated. Many coconut farms are organic by default but are not certified. Certified processors help them to get certification.

EMBEDDEDNESSS AND POWER: Embeddedness measures the connectedness between actors and benefits generated for themselves and local communities. With linkages to many actors, brokers including middlemen of raw coconut and exporters of coconut oil benefit most from certification. The middlemen are key players that link farmers, who are considered to get least benefits, to the rest of the actors in the value chain. Embedding more actors in certified value chain generates more benefits to the community like better quality, healthier, and safer products and good environment. Both processors and exporters of coconut oil have the capacity and power to influence government policy. But middlemen have the power to set and negotiate level of

³ Philippine Accreditation Bureau of the Department of Trade and Industry (DTI-PAB)

⁴ The Organic Certification Center of the Philippines (OCCP) and Negros Island Certification Services (NiCert) are two national OCBs, but the latter is currently renewing its accreditation.

⁵ Philippine Coconut Authority (PCA)

product prices in the value chain. The farmers have the least power in many aspects of the value chain.

BARRIERS AND OPPORTUNITIES: The most important motivation for organic certification is increase in income, which was achieved by many actors in the value chain except for farmers. But there are many barriers to certification. While certification fees and required paperwork are severe barriers when making decisions to be certified, access to finance to convert into organic production is severe barrier when implementing certification. The provision of subsidy is considered key to creating opportunities from certification. The most important opportunities include more profits from organic than conventional farming and higher prices for certification fees are important to make certification, and thus economic opportunities, more accessible to actors.

CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs): Actors in the value chain consider their production and business to have important contribution to decent employment (i.e. sufficient income, prevent child labour, safe workplace) and environmental conservation (i.e. no impacts on soil and water degradation, biodiversity loss and deforestation). But they have less contributions to other SDGs particularly gender equality and partnership. Certification of their production and business is considered to have positive impacts on environmental conservation, sustainable production and consumption, decent employment, and partnership. Only processors are most convinced that organic certification has positive impacts on gender equality. Many certified processing companies already provide women equal opportunities in supervisory and/or decision-making roles.

POLICY CHALLENGES: The current system of organic certification is not very inclusive, with farm producers neither playing an important role nor receiving significant benefits. The nature of agricultural production and profile of farm producers make economic benefits from certification less accessible to the coconut producers, resulting to non-compliance. But this condition also

affects the business of processors who bear the costs of the certification and harms the competitiveness of the exporters in the world market. The lack of competition among OCBs contributes not only to high costs of but also to low standard for certification. This is critical to the government support system for certification, which depends on OCBs in preparing farmers to qualify for subsidy and facilitating the achievement of the SDGs through certification.

11

POLICY OPTIONS: Seven main policy options were identified from the analysis of data from survey and interviews – enhance knowledge on organic practices, provide access to resources and facilities, strengthen partnership in value chain, develop a competitive sector of OCBs, create innovative but affordable

certification system, create domestic market for organic products, and consolidate government support programs. These options could address the important challenges confronting the value chain actors in the coconut oil industry and institutions that are involved in organic certification in the Philippines. They could serve as inputs to the NAP which will aim to improve the system of organic certification and discussion points for the national multistakeholder platform which will be established to enhance the role of VSS in achieving SDGs in the country.

12

MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PLATFORM: There is a very strong support for the establishment of a national Multi-Stakeholder Platform. However, interest in participating in the Platform is very low among the value chain actors, except for the processors of coconut oil. The main reasons for this are lack of time, capacity, and knowledge. Thus, the role of the platform should aim to

transform from knowledge-sharing to standard setting, allowing the value chain actors to first gain knowledge on organic certification and then to effectively contribute in the discussions on setting standards (i.e. VSS). Analyses of embeddedness level and power in the value chain of coconut oil as well as the challenges in the system of organic certification in the Philippines emphasize the need to pay attention on the goals, representation, power balance, and leadership of the national multi-stakeholder platform.

Fostering Green Exports through Voluntary Sustainability Standards



Assessment of Readiness for Organic Certification

Philippines Virgin Coconut Oil Value Chain

The project <u>"Fostering green exports through Voluntary Sustainability Standards</u>" of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) helps developing countries build their capacity to achieve sustainable growth through green exports.

Using the VSS Perception Assessment Toolkit developed under this project, UNCTAD works together with the government and industry stakeholders to identify policy options to capture green market opportunities and contribute to the country's achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

This brochure summarizes the **key challenges and policy options** identified in the assessment of the preparedness of Filipino stakeholders to enter the organic virgin coconut oil market.

The assessment is based on a survey and interviews of 102 input providers, farmers, processors, brokers and representatives from academia, government and certification institutions from Quezón, Laguna and Batangas.

Challenges

- Getting organic certification is administratively burdensome
- Organic certification is costly
- Incentives to comply with standards are low
- Low productivity leads to nonorganic practices
- Local demand is low
- There are too few organic certifying bodies
- The subsidies programme has limitations

Policy options

Among others:

- Build capacity to produce organic inputs
- Provide extension services
- Support membership in associations
- Increase the number of accredited organic certifying bodies
- Integrate organic practices in livelihood programmes

...more on page 5



Challenge 1: Too much work needed to get certified

- Filling in certification documents and keeping records for audits is challenging for producers.*
- Processors and exporters have to do this for multiple certifications.
- $\circ~$ It is difficult for processors and exporters to train producers.

We asked stakeholders if they think cost, paperwork, inspections, and others are barriers to getting certified. Figure 1 shows what percentage of each type of actor considers those factors to be severe barriers to certification.



Figure 1. Severe barriers to certification, by actor type

Note: Values refer to the percentage of respondents who consider each issue a severe barrier to certification.

Processors, brokers and institutions** think that the *cost of certification*, and the *time and paperwork* required for the application are severe barriers to decide to get certified (left side of Figure 1). Institutions also think that the *length of validity* of certification, the *length of transition period* to become certified, and the *lack of competition among OCBs**** are severe barriers to decide to get certified.

Lack of access to finance to convert to organic production is the main barrier in the process to get certified (right side of Figure 1). Other barriers are *finding buyers* for certified products, incidence of *pest and diseases* in certified farms, vulnerability of farm production to *climate extremes* and soil infertility, and *costs of labour and training* for organic production.

In general, producers do not have a clear idea of what factors are barriers to certification.

Challenge 2: High costs of organic certification

- Certification is too expensive for producers.
- Processors and/or exporters apply and pay for certification for producers.
- Transition periods are long, validity short, and renewal complex.
- The transition period from conventional to organic farming is 3-5 years.
- The fee for a national certification is Php 30,000 (US\$580). For an international one, the fee is Php 300,000 (US\$5,800). This is very expensive compared to the average annual income of a coconut farmer, around Php 20,000 and with volatile farmgate prices for coconut.
- Certifications are valid for 12 months. To renew a certification, processors need to go through the entire process again: present the same documents and pay the fee.

* The term "producers" refers to coconut producers: farmers, farm workers and farm tenants.

** The term "institutions" refers to representatives of academia, government and certifying bodies.

^{***} OCB stands for organic certifying body.

Challenge 3: Incentives to comply with standards are low

Producers do not perceive benefits from certification and inspections are not frequent. This leads to poor compliance, harming the credibility of Philippine organic products.

We asked who benefits the most from certification and who is most disadvantaged by it. Stakeholders agreed that processors, exporters and middlemen benefit the most from certification and producers are the most disadvantaged by it (Figure 2).





The survey revealed that producers are the least embedded and have the least power among the value chain actors in terms of their access to information and resources. Since they do not perceive benefits, **farmers lack incentives to comply** with standards.

In addition, the infrequency of inspections, limited by the number of inspectors available, increases the risk of non-compliance. These factors render the quality and quantity of coconut oil inconsistent, making it more difficult for exporters to meet the demand of foreign buyers.

Challenge 4: Low productivity leads to non-organic practices

Factors affecting productivity: old trees, soil erosion, climate change, pests.

It is difficult to comply with organic farming practices, because in many cases producers need to apply fertilizers or pesticides to coconut trees and other crops on the same farm. This is motivated by the low productivity of coconut due to:

- Old trees, soil erosion and urbanization: government programmes for replanting only cover a small portion of coconut farming.
- Pest and diseases: coconut scale insects (CSI) motivated the use of injections of nonorganic chemicals that caused rotting and damaged the reputation of the coconut industry in international markets. Policy supported the use of injections.
- Climate change: increase in the intensity of typhoons, rainfall and droughts. Programmes for seedlings or planting materials do not reach remote farms. No mitigation strategies are being adopted.

Challenge 5: local demand is low

Demand in the local market is small because benefits from organic production are not widely acknowledged and organic products are perceived to be expensive.

Challenge 6: Low number of organic certifying bodies (OCBs)

Only two accredited national OCBs (reinforces challenges 1, 2 and 3)



Note: DA is the Department of Agriculture, DTI is the Department of Trade and Industry, PCA is the Philippine Coconut Authority, DA-BAFS is the Bureau of Agriculture and Fisheries Standards in the DA; DTI-PAB is the Philippine Accreditation Bureau in the DTI.

Figure 4 shows the value chain of organic virgin coconut oil.

- Certification is based on *third-party* assessments. OCBs are accredited by the DA-BAFS.
- ✤ OCCP* and NiCert** are the only national OCBs (mainly for the domestic market).
 - They must comply with the Philippine National Standard for Organic Agriculture (PNS-OA).
- Control Union and ECOCERT are examples of international OCBs (for exports).
 - They must comply with the standards of different importing countries, e.g.: EU organic requirements, Japanese organic requirements (JAS), USDA NOP***, etc.
- Processors apply to the OCBs for organic certification directly. Farmers and micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs) apply to OCBs through processors, associations or government programmes.
- The DA and DTI provide direct support to the certification of production, processing, and export of coconut oil (through conditional subsidies and others). Many other agencies have programmes that raise awareness of and participation in organic certification.

Challenge 7: Limitations of subsidies

The conditions of the programme for subsidies affect its efficacy. It requires three years of organic practice prior to reimbursement (difficult because of challenge 2), guarantees by OCBs (difficult because of challenge 6) and exporters do not qualify (challenge 5).

*Organic Certification Center of the Philippines

** Negros Island Certification Services (renewing its accreditation at the time of this study)

^{***} United States Department of Agriculture National Organic Program

Policy options to address challenges

... to enhance the knowledge of producers

- Build public awareness on the key role of farmers in certified value chains (challenges 1 and 3)
- Implement organic education in schools (challenges 1 and 3)
- ... to provide access to resources and facilities
 - Build capacity to produce organic inputs and integrate them in livelihood programmes (challenges 2, 3 and 4)
 - Create access to small-scale processing facilities at affordable rates (challenges 2 and 3)
- ... to strengthen partnership
 - Provide entrepreneurial skills/support to shift away from traditional production structures (challenge 3)
 - Support membership in associations (challenge 3)
 - Provide extension services (challenge 3)
- ... to foster a competitive OCB sector
 - Facilitate the accreditation of more OCBs (challenge 6)
 - Provide capacity-building for OCBs (challenge 6)
- ... to create an innovative certification system
 - Provide a premium to producers (challenge 3)
 - Promote the sharing of certification costs (challenge 3)
 - Reduce paperwork (challenge 1)
 - Require less documents for renewal (challenge 1)
 - Align standards (challenge 1)
 - Set up an online platform for best practices and knowledge-sharing (challenge 1)
- ... create a domestic market
 - Make processed organic products affordable for local consumers (challenges 3 and 5)
 - Increase awareness (challenges 3 and 5)
 - Improve marketing strategies for organic products (challenges 3 and 5)
- ... consolidate supporting actions
 - Integrate organic practices in livelihood and productivity programmes (challenge 4)
 - Improve subsidy programmes, e.g. provide support for farmers and MSMEs during transition period (challenge 7)

Note: OCB stands for organic certifying body.

Virgin Coconut Oil Value Chain in the Philippines

Fostering Green Exports through Voluntary Sustainability Standards in Developing Countries

With global demand for "eco-friendly" or "green" products – i.e. those that are considered nature-based, healthy, eco-friendly, and socially correct – on the rise, major retailers increasingly opt for products that claim to be sustainable.

One way a product can claim to be "green" is by carrying eco-labels that confirm that products meet Voluntary Sustainability Standards (VSS).

Voluntary Sustainability Standards are norms and standards that are used to ensure that a product in question is produced, processed or transported in accordance with certain sustainability metrics, such as environmental impacts, basic human rights, labour standards, and gender equality. Many VSS schemes grant certifications or labels as "seals-of approval".

Around 500 VSS today apply to key exports of many developing countries, such as coffee, tea, bananas, cocoa, palm oil, timber, cotton, and organic agrifoods.

Well known VSS include Fairtrade International, Marine Stewardship Council, Rainforest Alliance, Better Cotton Initiative, UTZ, and many others.

But how can developing countries ensure that no one is excluded from benefiting from VSS, including small-scale producers?

UNCTAD's Project on "Fostering green exports through Voluntary Sustainability Standards" aims to help developing countries build their capacity to use VSS as a tool to achieve win-win-win outcomes, i.e.:

- Inclusive economic growth though fostering green exports
- Production practices that are complementary to environmental protection
- Business environment that is complementary to better social development

The project can also contribute to countries' achievement of the <u>Sustainable Development</u> <u>Goals</u> 1, 2, 8, 12 and 15.



Project Code:	<u>1617AI</u>
Partners:	UNFSS member organizations (FAO, ITC, UNEP, UNIDO)
Donor:	United Nations Development Account
Beneficiaries:	Vanuatu, Lao People's Democratic Republic, and the Philippines
Duration:	2017-2019

VSS Perception Assessment Toolkit

UNCTAD developed the VSS Perception Assessment Toolkit to help users systematically collect data on the preparedness of different stakeholders to adopt a VSS in specific agricultural value chains. The toolkit guides users to map the value chain of interest and identify all relevant stakeholders, to survey them through a structured questionnaire and interview them with open-ended questions. A guide to analyse the resulting data is also suggested.

The toolkit can shed light on the understandings and tensions of different stakeholders along the value chain, which underlie the adoption of certification and sustainable production methods. For policymakers, the visualization of these motivations will not only help identify power and perception asymmetries among value chain actors, but also contribute to the detection of areas where policy could play a role in mitigating unintended effects of VSS adoption.

For more information on the VSS Perception Assessment Toolkit go to:

https://unctad.org/en/Pages/DITC/Trade-Analysis/TAB-Project-1617AI.aspx

































