

**UNITED NATIONS COMMISSION ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY
FOR DEVELOPMENT (CSTD)**

**Contribution to the CSTD ten-year review of the implementation of WSIS
outcomes**

Submitted by

THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

DISCLAIMER: The views presented here are the contributors' and do not necessarily reflect the views and position of the United Nations or the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development.

Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation

Information for preparation of 10-year Overview of Progress in the Implementation of World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) outcomes (Geneva, 2003 – Tunis, 2005) under the United Nations Commission on Science and Technology for Development (CSTD)

1. To what extent, in your experience, has the "people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented Information Society", envisaged in the opening paragraph of the WSIS Geneva Declaration of Principles, developed in the ten years since WSIS?

A sustainable development can be observed in the segments of Information Society in all countries over the world; however, the rate and the growth of such the development are differing. A solution to this problem largely depends on the level of welfare of countries and funds allocated for the development.

However, it should be noted that this process is not finished and the WSIS objectives – to reduce digital, technology and knowledge divides and create "people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented Information Society" where every person is free to create information, have access to it, use and share it – still are of the utmost importance.

2. How far do you consider the implementation of specific WSIS outcomes to have been achieved?

Overview and assessment of the implementation of Action Lines of the WSIS Plan of Action are given in Section "B" "Overview of the implementation of Action Lines" of WSIS+10 Statement on the Implementation of WSIS Outcomes. Implementation of para 35 provisions in the section «Internet Governance» of Tunis Agenda for the Information Society, particularly subparagraphs a) and d), remains dominantly influenced by one state. In this regard, not a single certain proposal has been implemented within 10 years of the Internet Governance Forum. A new efficient international mechanism is needed which would take into account equitable interests of all countries and organizations concerned.

3. How has the implementation of WSIS outcomes contributed towards the development of a "people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented Information Society"?

Modern ICT penetration has improved in developing countries, countries with economies in transition, least developed countries, small island developing states, landlocked developing countries. ICT is generally recognised as a key factor and

driver for implementation of Millennium Development Goals. We consider it appropriate to include this topic in the Post-2015 Development Agenda.

4. What are the challenges to the implementation of WSIS outcomes? What are the challenges that have inhibited the emergence of a "people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented Information Society"?

Challenges during implementation of Action Lines and new challenges that have emerged are given in Section «C» (under the same name) of the WSIS+10 Statement on the Implementation of WSIS Outcomes, as well as the following challenges:

- Insufficient elaboration of the national regulatory framework for ICT development
- Insufficient development of the system for creation and advanced training of human resources in the ICT
- Inadequate development of content in national languages
- Often advancing use of ICT for fraud and other criminal purposes, that undermines the trust for networking services as a whole
- High cost of ICT services compared to a population income.

5. How are these challenges being addressed? What approaches have proved to be effective in your experience?

Emerging challenges should be clearly and directly identified, and their solutions be harmonized with all participated stakeholders taking into account their rights and responsibilities on local, national, regional and international levels.

For example, within 10 years the Russian Federation has established legislative framework in the field of telecommunications (Federal Laws 126-FZ “On communications”, 2124-1-FZ “On mass media”, 149-FZ “On information, information technology and information protection”).

Educational standards of secondary and higher professional education provide multistage training of specialists both in the ICT industry and in other industries for ICT use in professional activities. School pupils have «Informatics and ICT» as a compulsory subject. Universities are implementing the Project “Educational ecosystem at the municipal level for intergenerational population adaptation to modern ICTs” which has been presented at WSIS Prizes 2014 for C4 «Capacity Building».

There is a dynamic development of content in Russian language with the demand for it not only in Russia but also in CIS countries.

6. What do you consider the most important emerging trends in technology and other aspects of ICTs which have affected implementation of WSIS outcomes since the Summit? What has been their impact?

Inclusive Information Society has seen some new trends. Among others, broadband communications (ADSL, Ethernet, 2.5G, 3G, WiMax, 4G, DVB which allow content delivery with higher quality at higher transmission rates to a wide range of users), mobility, smart technologies, cloud services, social networks, massive open online courses (MOOC) and online participation have emerged. Implementation of ICT applications and services into socially relevant fields of economy such as education and medicine allows diversity and increased efficiency of services provided to users in the respective fields. Implementation of cloud technologies to develop e-Government services is an effective and economy tool covering a large multi-user audience. This results in unprecedented enhancement of capabilities to provide various and vital services and applications of ICT to everybody, which however has a penalty - increasing the digital divide.

7. What should be the priorities for stakeholders seeking to achieve WSIS outcomes and progress towards the Information Society, taking into account emerging trends?

Priorities are detailed in Section B «Priority areas to be addressed in the implementation of WSIS Beyond 2015» of WSIS+10 Vision for WSIS Beyond 2015.

However the following topics could be highlighted:

- Reducing costs of connection and use of ICT services
- Prior development of security in the use of ICT
- Human capacity building for efficient use of ICT capabilities.

8. What role should information and communications play in the implementation of the Post-2015 Development Agenda?

On the one hand, information is one of the main production resources, and high-technology product on the other hand. As the resource, it allows creating new goods and services, improving population's quality of life, and stimulating development of the whole humanitarian sphere. As the end product, it allows forming new knowledge bases, finding new fundamental laws of the universe and human society evolution, and stimulating the progress in general.

At this, communications serve as the transportation means, first of all. Early development of infrastructure is always the necessary prerequisite for the successful development of the technological process as a whole. So, the early development of ICT is the necessary prerequisite of dynamic evolution of the information society as a whole.

With this regard, ICTs will play the crucial role in achieving the goals of the Post-2015 Development Agenda (process of the MDG overview and process of the implementation of WSIS outcomes).

9. Please add any other comments that you wish to make on the subject of the review that you believe would be helpful.

Since the establishment of the WSIS, the Russian Federation has ensured the integrated framework for the development of information society by adoption of “Strategy for the Development of the Information Society in the Russian Federation” and appropriate programmes for its implementation.

In 2010 Russian Government by its Decree No.1815-r of 20 October 2010 adopted the State Programme of the Russian Federation “Information Society (2011-2020)” under which the Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation and its subordinate federal services shall implement measures to build the information society in the Russian Federation.

Thus, in 2010-2012 within the implementation of the “Information State” sub-programme a prototype of National Information and Communication Platform (NICP) was developed for dissemination of digital content. The NICP is aimed to:

- increase the efficiency of the protection of author’s rights and neighbouring rights to different products of intellectual activity of all participants of the process: state, rightholders and consumers;

- establish a conceptual and technological framework for the development and implementation of a nation-wide content identification system;

- reach better compliance between reality and principles of the international law in the field of the intellectual property rights protection;

- decrease the level of crimes associated with violation of author’s rights and reduce the volume of illegal content distributed through Internet;

- increase the market share of legal content in the Russian Federation and decrease the content price for end users.

Simultaneously, in 2013 in order to develop mass media and promote professional activity in this field, the annual Russian Government Awards in the field of mass media were established; while previously such awards were granted only in the field of paper publications media.

In addition, the Federal State Programme “Development of TV broadcasting in the Russian Federation for 2009-2015”, which was approved by the Decree of the Russian Government No. 985 of 3 December 2009, anticipates the development of the Russian information space, the provision to the population of multichannel broadcasting with guaranteed access to all-Russian mandatory free-to-air public TV and radio channels of specified quality, as well as the increased efficiency of TV broadcasting.

Also, it should be noted that within the indicated period the Russian Federation has adopted some legislative measures to counteract violations in the information space. Specifically, para 6, Article 10 of Federal Law 149-FZ of 27 July 2006 “On information, information technologies and information protection” has established

the prohibition on the dissemination of information promoting war and incitement to national, racial or religious hatred or hostility, as well as of other information which is subject to criminal or administrative responsibility for its dissemination.

However, restrictions on information acquisition or dissemination are unacceptable, unless they resulted in violation of somebody's rights (i.e. child abuse). And the dissemination of illegal information through the Internet could not and should not be considered without its prior assessment within the scale of social danger. In this case, a balance should be met between free dissemination of information and compliance with the law.

In particular, Article 15.1 of Federal Law 149-FZ of 27 July 2006 "On information, information technologies and information protection" provides the possibility to include four types of information of extreme social danger (child pornography, drug sales and production, calls for suicides, and information on the victimized underaged), with undoubtedly prohibited access, into the register pursuant, *inter alia*, to the decision of the federal executive authorities (Federal Drug Control Service of the Russian Federation, Roskomnadzor and Rospotrebnadzor) and according to the order established by the Government of the Russian Federation.

The Article is not aimed at censoring the Internet and does not alter the general principle of qualifying some types of Internet-accommodated information as illegal, and, therefore, prohibited for distribution within the Russian Federation.

In addition, Federal Law 222-FZ of 21 July 2014 "On state regulation of the activities involving the organization of and carrying on gambling and on amendment of some legislative acts of the Russian Federation" has come into force from 22 August 2014, as well as some legislative acts of the Russian Federation.

The above Law stipulates that the information violating the requirement of Federal Law 244-FZ of 29 December 2006 "On state regulation of the activities involving the organization of and carrying on gambling and on amendment of some legislative acts of the Russian Federation" and Federal Law 138-FZ of 11 November 2003 "On lotteries" prohibiting the organization and carrying on gambles and lotteries using the Internet and other communications shall be included into the unified automated information system "Unified register of the domain names, web-site references and network addresses that allow identifying web-sites containing information circulation of which is forbidden in the Russian Federation.

Moreover, from 1 February 2014, the amendments (Federal Law 398-FZ of 28 December 2013 "On the amendments to the Federal Law On information, information technologies and information protection) have come into force; they state that upon detection in the IT networks including Internet of any information containing calls for mass disorders, extremist activity, participation in mass (public) events violating established rules for their carrying out, including

notification on the dissemination of such information from the federal government authorities, government authorities of the Russian Federation subjects, local government authorities, organizations or citizens, the Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation or his/her deputies shall request appropriate authorities to take measures on the limitation of the access to the information resources disseminating such information.

At the same time, from 1 August 2014, Federal Law 97-FZ of 5 May 2014 “On the amendments to the Federal Law On information, information technologies and information protection” has come into force, as well as some legislative acts of the Russian Federation on the matters of harmonization of information exchange with use of IT networks” developed to protect the civil rights and to harmonize the information dissemination and data exchange between Internet users.

In the above mentioned Law, establishment of the blogger status and the organizer of information distribution status is a logical continuation of recent repeatedly voiced position of the Russian Federation at the events within the frameworks of preparation to the WSIS +10, and at the platforms of largest international organizations such as the UN (UNESCO, Human Rights Council) and OSCE on assigning the status of journalists to the so called new media figures – new participants of media relations: bloggers, informants and others (hereinafter – bloggers).

In particular, this Law is introducing concepts of the owner of an open personal site (page) in the Internet network (blogger) and an organizer of information distribution in the Internet network. The latter means a person providing the functionality of information systems and (or) software for computers which are intended and (or) used to receive, transmit, deliver and (or) process electronic messages of Internet users.

The mechanism proposed by the Federal Law 97-FZ is based on a principle according to that the owner of internet-site or its page having accomodated public information and access to which within three days accounts more than three thousands users adheres to the requirements to the information distribution established by the law. In the case of illegal information detection the owner of the internet-site or page is capable to delete such the information, thereby putting the end to the distribution of non-trustworthy information.

Along with that, in accordance to the provisions of the Federal Law 97-FZ (part 3 of Article 10.1. of Federal Law 149-FZ of 27 July of 2006 “On information, information technologies and information protection”) the organizer of information distribution through the Internet shall store in the Russian territory the information on the facts of received, transmitted, delivered and (or) processed voice messages, written text, images, sounds or any other electronic messages of Internet users, and information about such users during six months since the moment of the end of such actions, and also submit the above stated information to the authorized governmental agencies carrying out operative investigations or ensuring security of the Russian Federation in cases specified by federal laws.

At the same time, in the era of information society, the key prerequisite to the competitive, highly developed and technological economy is frequently the

possibility of open exchange and access to the information. Recognizing the necessity to protect author's rights to their products, we consider that the existing regulation in the sphere of intellectual property does not duly correspond to society interests and should be revised.

In particular, since 1 August of 2013 in the Russian territory, a procedure is introduced for operative restriction of access to the cinema films, TV films distributed through the Internet without appropriate permission from the right holders, based on various mechanisms.

Along with that, it is extremely important to keep balance of interests between right holders, information intermediaries and other stakeholders, concerning the governmental regulation of relations in the sphere of author's and neighboring rights including those in information and telecommunication networks (in the digital environment), particularly in making new principles of regulatory frameworks and further law enforcement.

Law regulation in the field of circulation of intellectual property products through the Internet shall be also focused on reducing administrative barriers in the information and telecommunication Internet network.

Nowadays right holders together with representatives of the Internet community actively elaborate new approaches to solve the piracy challenge in the Internet network, establish limits for responsibility of internet intermediaries and appropriately amend the Russian Federation law.

For the part concerning improvement of skills in the information access and implementation of media and information literacy (MIL) presented in C3 "Access to information and knowledge" of the WSIS final document we say the following.

Since 2013 in accordance with the Activities plan of the Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation for the period of 2013-2018, the Ministry has deployed an active work to enhance the level of media literacy for the population. Media literacy includes the following: ability to use search systems and find necessary and useful information, capability to distinguish between fair and trusted information sources and not fair ones, knowledge on parental control systems and skills to use them, understanding that it is not reasonable to place excessive personal information and personal data in the Internet, to avoid be victimized by criminals.

In 2013 according to the request of the Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation, the study has been carried out on "Assessment of current state and perspectives to change media literacy of the Russian population, based on national monitoring of media behavior, and relevant tasks of massive media education". According to this data, media literacy in our country was 15% at the end of 2013. This figure is planned to reach 55 % till 2018. In addition, the following media literacy criteria were approved by the Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications of the Russian Federation Order № 226 of 28 July 2014:

- skill to use search systems and find necessary information;
- ability to pay attention to the information sources, verify information and assess it critically;

- ability to protect personal data in the Internet and avoid information leakage concerning private life which can be of interest for criminals;
- knowledge on parental control systems, ability to use them, and also ability to carry out course of personal safety study for children concerning their activities in social networks and Internet;
- ability to compare the information from various sources and seek verification of any received information.

To achieve the task, a methodology to evaluate media literacy of population is currently being developed. In addition with a purpose to increase media literacy of the population, it is planned to launch programmes for promotion of media and computer literacy via federal mass media in 2014.

We also have 2 remarks to be addressed in future work of WSIS.

1. Russia opposes separated reviews on the progress made in implementing Geneva Plan of Action and Tunis Agenda for the Information Society and also against dividing between interrelated issues on ICTs development and Internet Governance.

We are not satisfied that key provisions of Tunis Agenda for the Information Society (para 35 “a” which recognizes that “Policy authority for Internet-related public policy issues is the sovereign right of States”) have not received due attention from the UN and the world community.

Internet Governance Forum, established to solve the above tasks, since its establishment proved to be ineffective as an entity ready on its own to bear responsibility for the development and adoption of the global policy in the field of Internet governance. There is a need for new organizational forms of its work within the framework of more pragmatic, coordinated and inclusive process – WSIS.

Immediate measures are required for internationalization of the critical Internet resource governance and development of the global policy for mutual trust under the aegis of the ITU. Such resources should be fairly distributed between the countries, establishing conditions for their shared governance based on the principles of interstate trust.

2. Russia stands for the WSIS process to be continued and the relevant decision to be adopted by the UN General Assembly to lay the ground for the establishment of a common line for the development of information space for the next decade, including the Internet Governance.

It is important to develop a new paradigm for the development of the Information Society that would grow into the Knowledge Society in the future. It is inadmissible to put the development of the society on the same footing as the development of technologies while neglecting the development of persons; and to substitute acquiring of knowledge for training in computer and smartphone skills. It should not be focused only on bridging the digital divide rather than the quality and safety of information in the Internet.

Up-to-date technologies offer wide opportunities for the creative development of mankind, while making serious harm, specifically to most vulnerable groups of population (children, youth) worsening their psychological

dependence on different gadgets. Moreover, due to recent mass electronic spying and eavesdropping telephones of state leaders and common people, a confidence to ICTs and Internet has been undermined. Such illegal actions of special services of some countries violate the citizens' privacy rights and other fundamental rights and freedoms guaranteed by the international law.

The recent report of the Council of Europe "ICANN's procedures and policies in the light of human rights, fundamental freedoms and democratic values" presented at the 50-th ICANN International Conference has officially confirmed that the ICANN procedures and policies criss-crossed the freedom of speech and right to privacy, and many of them are evidently contradicting these rights. The provisions of ICANN Registrar Accreditation Agreement requiring storage and disclosure of personal data constitute the interference in the privacy. Open access to the WHOIS data base does not constitute effective safeguards with regard to the way of collection and processing of personal data by third parties.