Feedback from tourism stakeholders (Kenya, India, Viet Nam) on the Sustainable Tourism for Development Guidebook

The views expressed are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of UNCTAD
Validation missions - purpose

• To test the methodology and guidance note in 6 pilot developing countries.
• The field missions evaluate the material and approach in terms of their ability to facilitate the understanding and capacity of EU Delegations in identifying priorities and appropriate actions for intervention in the field of sustainable tourism development.
• The mission also assess the structure and the flow of the draft study, as well as the technical content provided.
• The lessons learned during the missions will be taken into account in improving and finalizing the study.
### Selection criteria countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Senegal</th>
<th>Kenya</th>
<th>Botswana</th>
<th>Vietnam</th>
<th>East-Timor</th>
<th>India</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development status</td>
<td>LDC</td>
<td>OLIC</td>
<td>UMIC</td>
<td>LMIC</td>
<td>LDC</td>
<td>LMIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LLDC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIDS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass tourism</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialised/niche tourism</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nascent stage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Other criteria:** Equal distributions of countries between Africa and Asia, all having an EU presence, and at least one French speaking country
Mission process

- Sharing draft study with EU Delegation prior to the mission
- Prior discussion on priorities for consideration: select priority pillars
- Obtaining and assessing key literature
- Initial meeting with EU Delegation
- Interviews with key stakeholders
- Final meeting with EU Delegation
- Mission report
Stakeholders consulted

• Ministry of Tourism
• Public sector tourism agencies
• Private sector tourism associations
• Universities and institutions engaged in tourism research, teaching and training
• Other key ministries, e.g. Trade, Environment
• Key NGOs working in the field of development, poverty, and environment
• UN agencies and other development agencies present in the country
Field missions in 6 countries

- Senegal
- Botswana
- Timor-Leste
- Kenya
- India
- Vietnam
# Tourism context

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kenya</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>Vietnam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inbound tourism arrivals</strong></td>
<td>1,470,000</td>
<td>6,290,000</td>
<td>6,014,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inbound tourism receipts</strong></td>
<td>800 $m</td>
<td>17,518 $m</td>
<td>5,620 $m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inbound tourism expenditure over GDP</strong></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>n.a. (4.3%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EU Delegation engagement with tourism

**Kenya**
- Previous support by EU for Tourism Revival Marketing Programme and for Tourism Trust Fund
- Tourism now not seen as a priority
- Priorities now non-sectoral and more generic (e.g. governance, infrastructure, rural development)

**India**
- Not directly involved with tourism
- Indirect engagement through small projects, e.g. in culture or rural development
- Assistance thematic – e.g. human resource development

**Vietnam**
- Vietnam Human Resources Development in Tourism Project 2004-10
- Currently: Environmentally and Socially Responsible Tourism Capacity Development Programme 2011 - 15
The consultation process
The Methodology – 5 Pillars

Pillar 1
Tourism policy and governance

Pillar 2
Trade, investment, data and competitiveness

Pillar 3
Employment, decent work and capacity building

Pillar 4
Poverty reduction and social inclusion

Pillar 5
Sustainability of the natural and cultural environment
Methodology – logic

**PILLAR**
- Introduction of the Pillar with an explanation of its importance for the sustainable development of tourism.

**SUB-PILLARS**
- Identification of sub-pillars as key topics for each pillar.
- Identification of their scope, importance and what should be in place in each country.
- Examples of relevant existing initiatives.

**ISSUES**
- Identification of issues for each sub-pillar, as the basis for the assessment process.

**SET OF QUESTIONS**
- Set of questions about the situation in the country to determine whether the related issue is properly covered in the country or contains areas of weakness that need to be addressed.

**ACTIONS**
- List of possible actions that may be taken to address the issue. These actions are closely related to the subject of the questions that have been asked.

**EXISTING SERVICES**
- List of existing services, that are currently available from international bodies involved in sustainable tourism and that could address the weaknesses and problems identified through the assessment.
### Example of questions checklist

1.1 The position of tourism in development policies and programmes

**Issue 1: The level of recognition given to tourism in development policies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>QUESTION</th>
<th>COMMENT</th>
<th>No Action</th>
<th>For Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Is tourism given sufficient coverage and recognition in international studies and frameworks for development in the country?</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Is tourism considered a priority sector by government in its own development policies?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Is tourism recognised as a priority sector by departments of government that impact on the sector’s development?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) How much support is given to tourism from the national budget?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) What factors may be inhibiting the recognition afforded to tourism?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Relevance of the 5 Pillars

A key purpose of the field missions is to test the contents of the document. This includes the coverage of the 5 pillars –

– Are they relevant to the country – and how important?
– Are some aspects missing?
– Are they clear?
– Are the right questions asked?
Pillar 1: Tourism Policy and Governance

1.1 The position of tourism in development policies and programmes
• Level of recognition given to tourism in development policies
• The extent and nature of international assistance for sustainable tourism

1.2 Tourism policy and regulatory framework
• Existence of a tourism policy and strategic plan sufficient to guide development
• The implementation and monitoring of the policy/plan
• Adequacy of legislation and regulations affecting tourism

1.3 Tourism governance and institutional setup
• The effectiveness of central leadership structure for tourism
• The engagement of stakeholder interests in national tourism governance
• The involvement of the private sector and use of public-private partnerships
• The effectiveness of tourism governance at a local level
Pillar 2: Trade, Investment, Data and Competitiveness

2.1 Measuring tourism and its contribution to the economy
• The quality of data collection and analysis

2.2 Trade, investment and the business environment
• Recognition and treatment of tourism in trade and investment policies and commitments
• Extent of tourism investment and conduciveness of the business environment

2.3 Brand, marketing and product positioning
• Clarity and focus of brand and marketing plan
• Quality and diversity of the product offer

2.4 Resilience and risk management
• Level of attention paid to risk and crisis management
3.1 Human Resources planning and working conditions
• Existence of an HR policy, plan and actions – discussed and agreed
• Ensuring that employees’ rights and conditions for decent work are met

3.2 Skills assessment and the provision of training
• The level of understanding of skills gaps and training needs
• The availability of sufficient training/capacity building programmes and institutions
• The level of engagement of the private sector in supporting training and capacity building
Pillar 4: Poverty reduction and social inclusion

4.1 An integrated approach to poverty reduction through tourism
• Level of commitment to pro-poor tourism
• Adopting a strategic approach at national and local level

4.2 Strengthening pro-poor tourism initiatives
• The right conditions for business linkages and trading
• Securing wider community benefits from tourism

4.3 The inclusion of disadvantaged groups in the tourism sector
• Effort to engage disadvantaged groups in tourism

4.4 The prevention of negative social impacts
• Effort to identify and address negative social impacts
Pillar 5: Sustainability of the natural and cultural environment

5.1 Relating tourism to natural and cultural heritage
• Effective policies and actions to conserve and promote natural heritage
• Effective policies and actions to conserve and promote cultural heritage

5.2 Focussing on climate change
• Sufficient attention to climate change in the tourism sector

5.3 Enhancing sustainability of tourism development and operations
• The extent to which tourism development respects sustainability
• The extent to which tourism operations meet sustainability standards

5.4 Measuring and monitoring tourism impacts
• The extent of objective monitoring of environmental conditions and tourism impacts
Reactions to the document and approach

• Pillar topics all relevant – little missing
• Comprehensiveness is a strength – enables objective assessment of needs and opportunities for support
• Length of the document can be off-putting. Needs to be clearly explained at the outset – may require some reordering
• Logical and flows well – easy to follow and read
• Appreciate structure: Pillars – Sub-Pillars (themes) – issues – questions – actions – available services
• Descriptions of services in the Annex is seen as very helpful
• Lists of questions serve as a checklist of what to consider and ask in assessing approach to tourism
• Some detailed additions and amendments.
Future use – influencing funding priorities and interventions

• To help EU and other agencies to:
  – be more aware of the benefits and issues associated with tourism sector as a tool for sustainable development
  – understand the complexity and outreach of the sector
  – identify needs and opportunities for interventions to improve tourism’s contribution to sustainable development

• To inform EU and other agencies in discussions with government on country programmes and opportunities

• To inform governments (and other stakeholders) on matters they need to address and on which they might seek support
In identifying, justifying, prioritising and designing interventions
Need to consider:

• how tourism relates to current EU priorities for development – the Agenda for Change
• how tourism could contribute to individual country priorities of the EU and other agencies
• existing government priorities and needs (e.g. with respect to budget support)
• existing tourism plans, projects and opportunities that require support (financial or technical assistance)
• possible new projects that could be designed to relate to EU and government priorities and to the needs and potential of the sector.