Intergovernmental Group of Experts on E-commerce and the Digital Economy:

Prerequisites for a more equitable distribution of gains from the digital economy

Abdul Muheet Chowdhary chowdhary@southcentre.int
Senior Programme Officer, South Centre
Member, UN Subcommittee on Wealth Taxes

South Centre Tax Initiative
Taxinitiative@southcentre.int
Taxcooperation@southcentre.int
Tech Giants – How Do They Make Money?

Total Revenue
$117.9B

Net Income $39.4B

Revenue Breakdown
Advertising 97.5%
Other 2.5%

Revenue by Region

U.S. & CANADA 44%
ASIA PACIFIC 23%
EUROPE 29%
REST OF WORLD 9%

Facebook is still the largest social media platform in the world, with approximately 2.9 billion monthly active users (MAU).

Most popular social media networks
MAU as of Jun 2022

Source: Statista

Meta also owns the 3rd and 4th most popular apps, WhatsApp and Instagram.

Source: Visual Capitalist (2022)
Tech Giants – How Do They Make Money?

Total Revenue
$257.6B

Net Income $76.0B

Revenue by Region
- U.S.: 46%
- EMEA: 31%
- APAC: 18%
- OTHER AMERICAS: 5%
- OTHER: 3%

Advertiseing
Google Properties
- Google
- YouTube
- Google Maps
- 69.0%

Other Bets
- 0.4%

Google Other
- 18.3%

Source: Visual Capitalist (2022)
Tech Giants – How Do They Make Money?

Total Revenue $469.8B
Net Income $33.4B

Revenue Breakdown
- Online Stores: 47.3%
- Amazon Prime: 13.2%
- Amazon Web Services: 6.8%
- Advertising Services: 6.6%
- Subscription Services: 3.6%
- Physical Stores: 0.5%
- Other: 0.5%

Revenue by Region
- U.S. 57%
- U.K. 7%
- Japan 3%
- Germany 8%
- Rest of the World 14%

Amazon is the leading e-commerce platform in America, accounting for 40.4% of total U.S. e-commerce sales.

Source: Visual Capitalist (2022)
Digital Economy – Three Key Characteristics

• *Scale without mass*
  • Sell in more countries without needing more assets

• *Heavy reliance on intangible assets*
  • Rather than land, factories, etc relies on software, algorithms and other intellectual property

• *Data and user participation*
  • «Users» provide value (what would Instagram be if nobody posted photos?)

• (OECD Tax Challenges Arising from Digitalisation – Interim Report 2018)
Tech Giants – Richer Than Countries

- Amazon: +27% from 260.5 to 332.4
- Apple: +39% from 182.7 to 254.4
- Alphabet: +45% from 125.6 to 182.3
- Microsoft: +21% from 110.2 to 133.2
- Meta: +45% from 57.9 to 84.2
Tech Giants – Richer Than Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company</th>
<th>Revenues (USD billion in 2020)</th>
<th>Rank of economy if it were a country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GAFAM (Google, Apple, Facebook, Amazon, Microsoft)</td>
<td>736.9</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amazon</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apple</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alphabet</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microsoft</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meta/Facebook</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: [Chowdhary and Diasso](South Centre, 2022)
# Tech Giants – Low Effective Tax Rates

## Silicon Six: from revenue to cash tax paid (2011-20)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Amazon ($bn)</th>
<th>Apple ($bn)</th>
<th>Facebook ($bn)</th>
<th>Google ($bn)</th>
<th>Microsoft ($bn)</th>
<th>Netflix ($bn)</th>
<th>Total ($bn)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revenue ($bn)</td>
<td>$1,592.9</td>
<td>$2,097.3</td>
<td>$327.8</td>
<td>$962.7</td>
<td>$963.0</td>
<td>$104.9</td>
<td>$6,048.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Booked profit ($bn)</td>
<td>$60.5</td>
<td>$597.3</td>
<td>$132.5</td>
<td>$253.5</td>
<td>$306.5</td>
<td>$8.2</td>
<td>$1,358.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current tax provision ($bn)</td>
<td>$10.7</td>
<td>$143.5</td>
<td>$30.3</td>
<td>$49.8</td>
<td>$79.1</td>
<td>$1.4</td>
<td>$315.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current tax provision / booked profit</td>
<td>17.7%</td>
<td>24.0%</td>
<td>22.9%</td>
<td>19.6%</td>
<td>25.8%</td>
<td>17.9%</td>
<td>23.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash income tax paid ($bn)</td>
<td>$5.9</td>
<td>$100.6</td>
<td>$16.8</td>
<td>$38.9</td>
<td>$55.3</td>
<td>$1.1</td>
<td>$218.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash tax paid / booked profit</td>
<td>9.8%</td>
<td>16.8%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>15.4%</td>
<td>18.0%</td>
<td>13.9%</td>
<td>16.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash tax paid / revenue</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>4.8%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>4.0%</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: [Fair Tax Mark](https://www.fairtaxmark.org) (2019)
MNE Profits Often Stashed in Tax Havens

Source: Wier and Zucman (UNU WIDER, 2022)
✓ Tax Link

✓ Profits from Digitalized Economy Not Being Paid To ‘Source’ (mainly developing) Countries

✓ Effective Taxation → Equitable Distribution of Gains

✓ «Currently, there is a mismatch between where value is extracted and where profits are taxed. Users in developing countries significantly contribute to the generation of value by global digital platforms and some state that, therefore, authorities in these countries should have the right to tax platforms accordingly»

✓ - How to make data work for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (para 29, UNCTAD 2023)
Key Takeaways Re: Equitable Distribution of Gains - II

✓ **Competition Link**

✓ Untaxed Profits Due to Tax Avoidance → More Money in the Companies’ ‘War Chests’

✓ Bigger War Chest → More Monopoly Tactics (Predatory Pricing, Mergers and Acquisitions, etc)

✓ **Tax Avoidance Fuels Monopolies and Oligopolies**

✓ **Clear Link Between Tax and Competition Policy**

✓ **Corollary: Effective Taxation Contributes to Fair Competition**

✓ «competition policy adapted to the digital economy represents an important prerequisite for a more equitable distribution of gains» - *How to make data work for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development* (para 28, UNCTAD 2023)
Rising Trend of ‘Market Consolidation’ (Monopolies)

Source: Nick Shaxson (Tax Justice Network, 2022)
Taxing the Digitalized Economy: Limits of Existing International Tax Rules

• Under existing international tax rules, taxing Foreign Companies requires them to have a physical presence (branch, subsidiary, office, factory, etc) in your country

• Not always applicable for digitalized businesses

• Even when physical presence (nexus) test met, attributing profits to local entity very difficult when intangible assets are involved

• Tech Giants experts at using tax havens to shift profits
Solutions – OECD – Amount A of Pillar One

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Characteristics:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multilateral – Country will have to sign a Convention – first time in history of international taxation that taxing rights allocated multilaterally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applies only to super-rich and profitable companies (EUR 20 billion annual turnover, 10% profit margin)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxes MNEs on global profits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allocates 25% of residual profits to market jurisdictions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual Profits = profits exceeding 10% of revenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country agreeing to it cannot tax any out of scope digital companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Re-allocation of taxing rights so will only work if US, EU and other countries where MNEs are headquartered agree to give up their taxing rights (which seems unlikely)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: [South Centre](https://www.southcentre.org) (2022)
## Key Characteristics:

- Article 12B taxes Income From Automated Digital Services
- ADS defined as services with ‘minimal human involvement’
- Eg – Online advertising, search engines, intermediation platform services, etc
- Bilateral – To be negotiated between countries who have a tax treaty
- No threshold; even a single transaction taxable if it qualifies as ADS

### Two options –

- Gross Method: Fixed rate on local turnover (eg 3-4%)
- Net Method: Methodology for calculating Net Profits which are then taxed at domestic rate

**Source:** [South Centre](https://www.southcentre.org) (2021)
Solutions – Unilateral or National Measures

Digital Service Taxes

Significant Economic Presence

Equalization Levy

Source: South Centre (2020)
Amount A vs. Article 12B for the 54 South Centre Member States (2018 to 2020)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>EUR 10 b</strong></td>
<td>5.5b</td>
<td>5.0b</td>
<td>6.5b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EUR 20 b</strong></td>
<td>4.9b</td>
<td>4.4b</td>
<td>5.8b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pure ADS</strong></td>
<td>4.0b</td>
<td>3.5b</td>
<td>3.1b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hybrid ADS</strong></td>
<td>8.6b</td>
<td>8.2b</td>
<td>7.4b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Amount A</strong></td>
<td>11.4b</td>
<td>10.9b</td>
<td>9.8b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: South Centre (2022)
Amount A vs. Article 12B for the 54 African Union Member States (2018 to 2020)

Tax Revenues ($USD Billions)

- **Amount A**
- **Article 12B Gross Method (3% tax rate)**
- **Article 12B Gross Method (4% tax rate)**
- **Article 12B Net Method**

**Source:** South Centre (2022)
Final Takeaways

UN Solution Gives Up to Three Times More Revenue to Developing Countries than OECD Solution

But UN Solution Requires Bilateral Negotiations; Time and Resource Intensive

UN Tax Committee Creating UN ‘Multilateral Instrument’ which can update multiple bilateral tax treaties simultaneously

Support of Developing Countries Required for This Effort

Next session of UN Tax Committee: October 2023, Geneva
Final Takeaways - II

Countries can also initiate national measures like Digital Services Taxes or Significant Economic Presence.

Most countries that have implemented DSTs collected more revenue than expected.

Eg – Kenya

Expected to collect $1 million from DST in 2022.

Collected $2 million (!)
THANK YOU

Please contact us for more information at:

Taxcooperation@southcentre.int
THE SOUTH CENTRE

International Environment House 2
Chemin de Balexert 7-9
POB 228, 1211 Geneva 19
Switzerland
Tel.: +41 22 791 8050
south@southcentre.int

THE SOUTH CENTRE IN SOCIAL MEDIA:

@South_Centre
SouthCentre GVA
South Centre, Geneva

FIND OUT MORE:
https://www.southcentre.int
https://taxinitiative.southcentre.int