UNITED NATIONS
COMMISSION ON SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY FOR DEVELOPMENT

Fifth Meeting of the Working Group on improvements to the Internet Governance Forum (IGF)
Geneva, Switzerland

20-22 February 2012

Chairman's summary of the meeting
(draft)

1. The fifth and final meeting of the Commission on Science and Technology for Development (CSTD) Working Group (WG) on improvements to the Internet Governance Forum (IGF) was held in the Palais des Nations in Geneva, Switzerland on 20-22 February 2012. It was chaired by Mr. Peter Major (Hungary).

2. In his opening statement[1], the Chair stressed the important and positive results of the fourth meeting of the Working Group (Geneva, 11-13 January 2012)[2] during which points of broad agreements were established and included in the rolling document[3], regarding each areas related to the IGF which were identified as requiring possible improvements, namely A. Shaping the outcomes of IGF meetings; B. Working modalities including open consultations, MAG and Secretariat C. Funding of the IGF, D. Broadening participation and E. Linking the IGF to other related process/mechanism/bodies. On this basis, the Chair outlined the expected goals of the fifth meeting, which was to focus on the drafting of recommendations on improvements to the IGF. In this regard, the Chair invited participants to aim at the establishment of clear recommendations with no ambiguity to ensure their effective and prompt implementation, possibly even at the next IGF.[4] The Chair also recalled that in its previous meetings the Working Group had agreed that micro-managing the IGF in view of its improvement should be avoided.

3. The Chair of the Working Group presented the consolidated version of the rolling document which was developed following his suggestion made at the fourth meeting concerning the format and structure of draft recommendations on improvements to the IGF.[5] To facilitate the finalisation of the expected draft recommendations, this document was established in an attempt to structure the work of the Group, taking full account of existing broad agreements, proposals where consensus could not be reached and which were therefore left in brackets for the sake of transparency, as well

---

[1] The "preliminary remarks" made by the Chairman of the Working Group at its Fifth Meeting is available at: http://www.unctad.org/sections/un_cstd/docs/UN_WGIGF2012d8_preliminary_remarks_en.pdf
[2] For more information, the "Chairman's summary" of the Fourth Meeting of the Working Group on Improvements to the IGF is available at: http://www.unctad.org/sections/un_cstd/docs/UN_WGIGF2012d5_summary_en.pdf
[3] The rolling document was established initially at the Third Meeting of the Working Group (Geneva, 31 October – 02 November) to capture points of discussion, including broad agreements concerning items A, B, C, D and E as well as proposals which could not find consensus and were therefore put in square brackets.
[4] The Seventh Annual IGF Meeting will be held in Baku, Azerbaijan from 6-9 November 2012. More information is available at: http://www.intgovforum.org/cms/
[5] For more information, see item 8 of the above-mentioned "Chairman's summary" of the Fourth Meeting of the Working Group

1

as additional points of discussion.[6] It is also important to note that for each item, general introductory "chapeaux" were proposed by the Chair on the basis of broadly agreed principles during the third and fourth meetings of the Group.

4. Following the adoption of the agenda, the Chair presented his preliminary draft recommendations on improvements to the IGF which were prepared on the basis of broad agreements contained in the consolidated version of the rolling document as well as the proposal made by one participant of the Group[7]. The Chairman's draft recommendations were sent by email to participants of the Working Group prior to the fifth meeting to serve as the main working document to facilitate the drafting exercise. Participants welcomed the solid and important work of the Chair and agreed with his suggestion to use his draft recommendations as a starting point in the drafting exercise which, as it was agreed, was to be carried out mainly in plenary with the possibility of working in small groups to address and solve complex drafting issues. In this regard, the Chair recalled the non-legally binding nature of the IGF. The expected draft recommendations on improvements to the IGF were to ensure that, as far as possible, flexibility and openness were maintained also during the drafting exercise.

5. Concerning the format of the draft recommendations, the Chair stressed the need to reduce their important number as they sometimes overlapped. Participants agreed that, as a whole, the final draft text should seek to be straightforward. In addition, the Chair invited participants to decide whether the established draft recommendations should reflect consensus strictly or if in case of dissent, other alternate recommendations should be included as footnotes. Participants were divided on this issue, however, for the sake of clarity leading to the practical and effective implementation of the proposed recommendations, the Chair decided that the included text would be strictly based on consensus.

6. Although participants did not have sufficient time to address every proposal made, including the so-called "chapeaux", draft recommendations on improvements to the IGF concerning the five areas mentioned above were, however, successfully established. To improve relevance and clarity of the tackled areas of improvements wording of items D and E were amended to D. Broadening participation and capacity-building and E. Linking the IGF to other Internet governance-related entities.

7. The Chair of the Working Group decided to send his expected draft Report prepared on behalf of the CSTD Working Group after the meeting with the clean version of the draft recommendations on improvements to the IGF to participants of Group by email for their comments and approval. Given the information provided by the CSTD Secretariat concerning the extremely limited time to finalize the draft report and recommendations which needed to be transmitted to the relevant UN services 14 weeks before the CSTD 15th session itself (21-25 May 2012) which also meant that an extension was to be sought as the deadline had already passed, the Chair decided to include only discussed and agreed proposals regarding which only editorial comments would be acceptable.

---

[6] For more information, the Chairman's consolidated version of the rolling document is available at: http://www.unctad.org/sections/un_cstd/docs/UN_WGIGF2012d7_rolling_en.doc
[7] Prior to the fourth meeting of the Working Group (11-13 January 2012), Marilia Maciel, Civil Society, transmitted by email a suggestion to categorize proposals made during the Third meeting of the Working Group and contained in its rolling document.

8. Concerning the follow-up to be given to the Report of the CSTD Working Group on Improvements to the IGF, various participants expressed their concern in relation to the ambiguity of the mandate of the Working Group in relation to its submission to the CSTD, the Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) and the UN General Assembly (GA).[8] Following the confirmation of the relevant UN services, the CSTD Secretariat confirmed that as last year, the way to proceed would be to submit the Report to the CSTD, ECOSOC and to the GA at the same time. In addition, the CSTD Secretariat informed participants that the Report will be examined at the 2012 substantive session of ECOSOC (New York, 25 June-20 July 2012) and at the 67th session of the GA (New York, 18 September-31 December 2012).

---

[8] GA Resolutions 2010/2 and 2011/16 on the "Assessment of the progress made in the implementation of and follow-up to the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society" read "submission of its recommendations to the Commission at its fifteenth session, which shall constitute an input from the Commission to the General Assembly, through the Economic and Social Council".

MEMBER STATES

Brazil
Mr. Rômulo Neves, Head of Division for the Information Society, Ministry of External Relations
Mr. Thiago Carnero, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission of Brazil to the WTO and other economic organizations in Geneva

Chile

Costa Rica
Ms. Sylvia Poll, Ambassador, Deputy Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Costa Rica to the United Nations
Ms. Roxana Tinoco, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Costa Rica to the United Nations

Egypt
Ms. Nermine El Saadany, Director of International Relations Division, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology

El Salvador
Mr. Félix Ulloa, Minister Counsellor, Permanent Mission of El Salvador to the United Nations in Geneva

Finland
Ms. Mervi Kultamaa, Counsellor, Information Society & Trade Facilitation, Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland, Department for External Economic Relations

Ghana
Mr. Anthony Kwasi Nyame-Baafi, Minister (Commercial) at the Permanent Mission of Ghana to the United Nations in Geneva

Greece
Mr. George Papadatos, Minister Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Greece to the United Nations in Geneva

Hungary
Mr. István Erényi, Senior Counsellor, Ministry of National Development, State Secretariat of Infocommunications and Media
Mr. Peter Major, Special Advisor, Permanent Mission of Hungary to the United Nations in Geneva

India
Ms. Tulika Pandey, Director, Department of Information Technology, Ministry of Communications & Information Technology *(remote participation)*
Ms. Nabanita Chakrabarti, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission of India

Iran (Islamic Republic of)
Mr. Alireza Tootoonchian, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the United Nations in Geneva
Mr. Mohsen Esperi, Counsellor, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Islamic Republic of Iran

Kenya
Mr. Anthony Andanje, Ambassador/Deputy Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of the Republic of Kenya to the United Nations in Geneva

Lesotho
Ms. Mpho Masupha, Intern, Permanent Mission of Lesotho to the United Nations in Geneva

Lithuania

Pakistan

Portugal
Mr. Luis Magalhães, Professor, Technical University of Lisbon, President of the Knowledge Society Agency (UMIC) up to 3rd January 2012, Ministry of Education and Science

Russian Federation
Mr. Alexander Petrov, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of the Russian Federation to the United Nations in Geneva

Slovakia
Mr. Igor Kucer, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Slovakia to the United Nations in Geneva

South Africa
Ms. Tshihumbudzo Ravhandalala, First Secretary, Permanent Mission of South Africa to the United Nations in Geneva
Mr. Mandixole Matroos, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission of South Africa to the United Nations in Geneva

Sri Lanka
Mr. Vijaya Kumar, Chairman, Industrial Technology Institute, Colombo, vice-chairman of CSTD Working Group on Improvements to the IGF

Switzerland
Mr. Thomas Schneider, Dept Head, International Affairs, Swiss Federal Office of Communications, Bienne
Mr. Dirk-Oliver von der Emden, Legal Adviser, Swiss Federal Office of Communications, Bienne
Mr. Giacomo Mazzone, Media Expert, Swiss Federal Office of Communications, Bienne

Tunisia

United States of America
Mr. Craig Reilly, First Secretary, Permanent Mission of the United States to the United Nations in Geneva

INVITED PARTICIPANTS

Business Community
Ms. Marilyn Cade, CEO, mCADE LLC
Mr. Jimson Olufuye, Vice-Chairman WITSA (Sub-Saharan Africa), Nigeria *(remote participation)*
Mr. Christoph Steck, Public Policy Director, Telefonica S.A.
Ms. Theresa Swinehart, Executive Director - Global Internet Policy, Verizon

Civil Society
Mr. Izumi Aizu, Senior Research Fellow & Professor, Institute for InfoSocinomics, Kumon Center, Tama University
Ms. Anriette Esterhuysen, Executive Director, Association for Progressive Communications
Mr. Wolfgang Kleinwächter, Professor, Department for Media and Information Sciences, University of Aarhus
Ms. Marilia Maciel, Project leader and researcher, Center for Technology and Society at Fundação Getulio Vargas *(remote participation)*
Mr. Parminderjeet Singh, Executive Director, IT for Change

Technical and Academic Community

Ms. Constance Bommelaer, Director, Public Policy, Internet Society *(remote participation)*
Ms. Samantha Dickinson, Internet Governance Consultant
Mr. Baher Esmat, Manager, Regional Relations - Middle East "Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers Cairo, Egypt
Ms. Nurani Nimpuno, Head of Outreach & Communication, Netnod (Autonomica)

Intergovernmental Organisations

International Telecommunication Union (ITU)
Ms. Jesungtlee Kim, Policy and Legal Analyst
Mr. Jean- Blaise Trivelli, Intern

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)
(remote participation)
Mr. Andrea Beccalli, Associate Expert, Knowledge Societies Division, Communication and Information Sector.

World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO)
Mr. Joe Bradley, Head, Intergovernmental Organizations and Partnerships Section, Department of External Relations
Mr. Victor Owade, Consultant, Intergovernmental Organizations and Partnerships Section, Department of External Relations

OTHER

Mr. Markus Kummer, Vice-President, Public Policy, Internet Society

IGF Secretariat
Mr. Chengetai Masango, Programme and Technology Manager
Ms. Farzaneh Badei, Consultant