

High Level Characteristics of Enhanced Cooperation

Revised version 26 Jan 2017

The spreadsheet shows a very rough analysis of which characteristics were suggested in the responses to Q1: “What are the high level characteristics of enhanced cooperation?”

Of course, this exercise cannot be scientifically accurate. Some responses clearly listed individual characteristics, but others mentioned possible characteristics “in passing” or included them along with other general points about enhanced cooperation. Some responses drew heavily on language from the Tunis Agenda, which itself suggests possible characteristics.

Although it is not scientifically accurate, however, the spreadsheet tries to offer a fair reflection of each response and a reasonable overall summary of the responses. It should also be noted that some responses used slightly different words to express the same concept (and some responses use the same word but meaning different concepts). This exercise merges some of the different ways of expressing the same concept into a set of 40 broad characteristics.

The table below shows the number of responses that propose each of these characteristics, in descending order. By this measure, the five most strongly supported characteristics of enhanced cooperation are:

- **Transparent**
- **Inclusive**
- **Multi-stakeholder participation**
- **Collaborative**
- **Flexible and adaptable**

The ten most strongly supported characteristics are:

- **Transparent**
- **Inclusive**
- **Multi-stakeholder participation**
- **Collaborative**
- **Flexible and adaptable**
- **Result driven**
- **Respecting the sovereign right of states to establish and implement public policy**
- **Evidence-based**

- **Sustainable**
- **Promoting sustainable development**

It should be made absolutely clear that the Working Group did not establish this exercise as a quantitative exercise. It should be remembered too that some of the stakeholders who responded would support characteristics that were suggested by other stakeholders, even if they did not suggest them in their own responses. This is in no way a “vote” and it may not be helpful to focus too much on the number of times a particular characteristic has been suggested.

However, this exercise can perhaps help the Working Group in trying to identify which characteristics represent a balanced view of the common ground and which are likely to have the greatest support. If these can be agreed, they should provide a context and a guide to the Working Group in considering the other kinds of recommendations that can be developed.

High Level Characteristic	Number of stakeholders that suggested it
Transparent	17
Inclusive	15
Multi-stakeholder participation	12
Collaborative	10
Flexible and adaptable	9
Result driven	7
Respecting the sovereign right of states to establish and implement public policy	7
Evidence-based	8
Sustainable	8
Promoting sustainable development	8
Participation by governments on an equal footing	6
Respecting human rights and fundamental freedoms	6
Responsive to innovation	5
Openness	4
Democratic	4
Effective communication	3
Consultation by governments	3
Accountability	3
Consensus-based	3
Capacity building	2
International	2
Strengthening cyber-security	2
Linked to other dialogue platforms	2
Peace	1
Trust in the integrity of the process	1
Secretariat support	1
Funding	1
Good faith	1
Taking place within established legal process	1
Self-regulation by the private sector	1
Desired state (not a process)	1
Fair and equitable	1
Collective responsibility	1
Technology transfer	1
Content	1
Diversity	1
Producing outputs	1
Continuous process	1
Considering under-represented groups	1
Stands the test of time	1

	Peace	Openness	Inclusivity / Inclusive/ Partipatory	Multi-stakeholderism/Multi- stakeholder participation/all stake-holders in their respective roles	Result driven / Effective
Africa ICT Alliance	x	x	x	x	x
Nick Ashton-Hart					
Association for Progressive Communications			x	x	
Assocation for Proper Internet Governance					
Australia					
Bulgaria				x	
Centre for Communication Governance (India)				x	
Globally Applicable Principles				x	
Centre for Internet and Society				x	
Cuba				x	
DENIC		x	x		
European Union			x		x
Hungary			x		x
India					
International Chamber of Commerce BASIS			x		x
ICANN			x		
Internet Society			x		x
Iran					
Japan				x	
IT for Change					
Wolfgang Kleinwaechter		x	x		
Mexico					
Janvier Ngnoulaye					
Pakistan					
RIPE NCC					
Russian Federation					
Saudi Arabia				x	
Switzerland			x		
Turkey			x	x	x
United Kingdom			x		x
UN ESCWA				x	
UNESCO		x	x	x	
United States			x		
Canada		x	x		
TOTAL	1	5	15	12	7

	Equal opportunity to participate among governments	Stakeholders and their respective roles and responsibilities are approached in a flexible manner/Flexible/Adaptable	Trust in the integrity of the process	Effective dialogue and debate / communication	Secretariat support
Africa ICT Alliance					
Nick Ashton-Hart					
Association for Progressive Communications	x	x	x	x	x
Association for Proper Internet Governance					
Australia					
Bulgaria					
Centre for Communication Governance (India)					
Globally Applicable Principles					
Centre for Internet and Society		x			
Cuba					
DENIC				x	
European Union		x			
Hungary		x			
India					
International Chamber of Commerce BASIS		x			
ICANN					
Internet Society					
Iran	x				
Japan					
IT for Change	x				
Wolfgang Kleinwachter				x	
Mexico		x			
Janvier Ngnoulaye					
Pakistan					
RIPE NCC					
Russian Federation	x				
Saudi Arabia	x				
Switzerland					
Turkey		x			
United Kingdom		x			
UN ESCWA	x				
UNESCO					
United States		x			
Canada					
TOTAL	6	9	1	3	1

	Capacity building	Access to information/open information sharing/transparent	Funding	Good faith	Member States shall have the sovereign right to establish and implement public policy...
Africa ICT Alliance					
Nick Ashton-Hart					
Association for Progressive Communications	x	x	x		
Association for Proper Internet Governance				x	x
Australia					
Bulgaria		x			
Centre for Communication Governance (India)					
Globally Applicable Principles					
Centre for Internet and Society					
Cuba					x
DENIC		x			
European Union		x			
Hungary		x			
India		x			x
International Chamber of Commerce BASIS		x			
ICANN		x			
Internet Society		x			
Iran					x
Japan		x			
IT for Change					x
Wolfgang Kleinwaechter		x			
Mexico		x			
Janvier Ngnoulaye					
Pakistan	x				
RIPE NCC					
Russian Federation					x
Saudi Arabia					x
Switzerland		x			
Turkey		x			
United Kingdom		x			
UN ESCWA					
UNESCO					
United States		x			
Canada		x			
TOTAL	2	17	1	1	7

	Improve collaboration between all stakeholders/ cooperative effort / shared decision-making and implementation	Evidence-based/Factual backing	Taking place within established legal process	Responsive to innovation/ Responsive	Self-regulation by the private sector	Consultation by governments
Africa ICT Alliance						
Nick Ashton-Hart						
Association for Progressive Communications						
Association for Proper Internet Governance						
Australia	x					
Bulgaria	x	x				
Centre for Communication Governance (India)						
Globally Applicable Principles	x		x	x		
Centre for Internet and Society					x	
Cuba						x
DENIC	x					
European Union		x		x		
Hungary		x		x		
India						
International Chamber of Commerce BASIS		x		x		
ICANN		x				
Internet Society	x					
Iran						
Japan						
IT for Change						
Wolfgang Kleinwachter	x					
Mexico	x	x				
Janvier Ngnoulaye						
Pakistan	x					
RIPE NCC						
Russian Federation						x
Saudi Arabia						x
Switzerland						
Turkey	x					
United Kingdom		x		x		
UN ESCWA						
UNESCO	x					
United States						
Canada		x				
TOTAL	10	8	1	5	1	3

	Desired state (not a process)	Sustainable	Respecting human rights and fundamental freedoms	Sustainable development / Bridge Digital Divide / Infrastructure	Fair and equitable	Democratic	Accountability
Africa ICT Alliance							
Nick Ashton-Hart							
Association for Progressive Communications							
Association for Proper Internet Governance							
Australia							
Bulgaria							
Centre for Communication Governance (India)							
Globally Applicable Principles							
Centre for Internet and Society							
Cuba	x						
DENIC		x					
European Union		x	x				
Hungary		x	x	x			
India				x	x	x	
International Chamber of Commerce BASIS		x	x				
ICANN				x			x
Internet Society							
Iran				x			
Japan							x
IT for Change							
Wolfgang Kleinwaechter		x					
Mexico		x					
Janvier Ngnoulaye							
Pakistan				x			
RIPE NCC							
Russian Federation				x			
Saudi Arabia						x	
Switzerland			x			x	x
Turkey							
United Kingdom		x	x	x			
UN ESCWA							
UNESCO						x	
United States							
Canada			x	x			
TOTAL	1	7	6	8	1	4	3

	Collective responsibility	International	Consensus-based / voluntary	Technology transfer	Strengthening cyber-security	Content	Diversity
Africa ICT Alliance							
Nick Ashton-Hart							
Association for Progressive Communications							
Association for Proper Internet Governance							
Australia							
Bulgaria							
Centre for Communication Governance (India)							
Globally Applicable Principles							
Centre for Internet and Society							
Cuba							
DENIC							
European Union							
Hungary							
India							
International Chamber of Commerce BASIS							
ICANN							
Internet Society	x						
Iran							
Japan							
IT for Change		x					
Wolfgang Kleinwaechter							
Mexico			x				
Janvier Ngnoulaye							
Pakistan		x		x	x		
RIPE NCC							
Russian Federation					x	x	
Saudi Arabia							
Switzerland							x
Turkey			x				
United Kingdom							
UN ESCWA							
UNESCO							
United States			x				
Canada							
TOTAL	1	2	3	1	2	1	1

	Producing outputs	Linked to other dialogue platforms	Continuous process	Special consideration for under-represented groups	Stand the test of time
Africa ICT Alliance					
Nick Ashton-Hart					
Association for Progressive Communications					
Association for Proper Internet Governance					
Australia					
Bulgaria					
Centre for Communication Governance (India)					
Globally Applicable Principles					
Centre for Internet and Society					
Cuba					
DENIC					
European Union					
Hungary					
India					
International Chamber of Commerce BASIS					
ICANN					
Internet Society					
Iran					
Japan					
IT for Change					
Wolfgang Kleinwaechter					
Mexico					
Janvier Ngnoulaye					
Pakistan					
RIPE NCC					
Russian Federation					
Saudi Arabia					
Switzerland					
Turkey					
United Kingdom					
UN ESCWA	X	X			
UNESCO					
United States		X	X	X	
Canada					X
TOTAL	1	2	1	1	1